

Transformation of Political Campaigns in the Digital Era: Case Studies of Indonesia and Spain

Muhamad Jamal ^{a,1,*}

^{*a} INISNU Temanggung, Indonesia

¹ mjaemmall2@gmail.com

^{*}Correspondent Author; mjaemmall2@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history

Received:

13-01-2026

Revised:

21-03-2026

Accepted:

22-04-2026

Keywords

Digital Campaigns, Social Media, Voter Engagement, Political Communication, Indonesia, Spain.

ABSTRACT

The coming of the internet era has dramatically influenced political campaigns in Indonesia and Spain. It has improved urban voter engagement and participation in Indonesia by highlighting its most visible work across social media platforms such as Twitter (X-Land) and Facebook in the 2019 and 2020 elections. However, challenges remain in terms of limited knowledge and skills for using digital technology, access problems to the internet, and especially harmful advertising efforts. Given this accuracy problem with surveys and the dissemination of misinformation, the Spanish elections in 2015 and 2019 cemented the role of Twitter (X-Land) data and social bots in extracting information about political communication and voter behavior. In light of these developments in both countries, one can realize that digital tools are taking political campaigns to a different level; appropriate legislation cannot be done without openness, and fairness is guaranteed. The study looks directly at the role of digital campaigns in modern political communication and participation processes, underpinning interactively technological and political relations.

This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.



Introduction

The digital age has transformed Indonesia's political landscape since political campaigns have shifted to social media platforms, cyber politics has indeed reconstituted the socio-political landscape of Indonesia (Gusfa & Kadjuand, 2020). The 2020 Regional Elections in Indonesia, being conducted during the pandemic period of COVID-19, pressed the need for digital campaigns to supplant activities restricted by health protocols. As such, they had to become a substitute for essence (Prasetyo et al., 2024). Social media platforms, such as Twitter (X-Land) and Facebook, have increased demand for their use by the political parties concerned

with formulating strategies and campaigns, as seen through the 2019 elections (Widayat et al., 2022). Still, digitalization has affected public communication but has also played a significant role in democratization and political campaigns (Fadhlorrohan & Purnomo, 2020).

Furthermore, campaigns have changed in this digital era to digital theocracy strategies and their influence on public opinion and voters' choices (Sahlan, 2023). For example, one study that examined local elections in the 2020 Pilkada in Depok City proved that digital campaigns increase political participation in urban areas (Siti Maryam et al., 2022). Moreover, the Internet and other new media are becoming part of the usual practices used by a government candidate in their political marketing efforts (Kurniawati et al., 2019). Big data integrated into political campaigns has implications for the political parties in Indonesia, although challenges remain for better utilization of the opportunity brought about in this regard (Fadillah et al., 2019).

The journey of political campaigns towards digital transformation has been marred with several challenges. From how digital campaigns malfunctioned during the COVID-19 pandemic (Prasetyo et al., 2024), A study by (Dhosa et al., 2021) comments on the politicization of S.A.R.A. as it causes threats to virtual public spaces. As recently stated, connections between digital campaigning and political financing should be regulated at the regional level in the Asia-Pacific area (Tham et al., 2022). The very concept of digital literacy has evolved way beyond that of mere access to the internet. It now encompasses how technology is used in political campaigns, including computational propaganda and hate spin politics (Salma, 2019).

It has also been too visible how much the political campaigns have changed considerably in digital-era countries like Indonesia and Spain. In Spain, the general election 2015 marked a significant turn during an economic crisis that reshaped the political panorama (Pavía et al., 2020). For that election, the Elections and Public Opinion Research Group at the University of Valencia conducted several surveys, collecting voter beliefs and intention data through online questionnaires and chain sampling, gathering more than 14,000 observations (Pavía et al., 2020). Despite challenges in sample representativeness, common in electoral opinion studies, efforts were made to ensure anonymity and predict election outcomes (Pavía et al., 2020).

Twitter (X-Land) data has become very prolific in gaining insight into political discourse. In this line, during the 2019 Spanish general election, a dataset containing approximately 800,000 users and 5.8 million tweets was derived from a pool of tweets on political hashtags. (Pastor-Galindo, Zago, Nespoli, López Bernal, et al., 2020). That dataset dealt with political and social bots. It was created to help researchers analyze their data, run machine-learning applications, and detect bots (Pastor-Galindo et al., Any researcher can immediately access the dataset on platforms like Mendeley Data to study Twitter (X-Land) activity during this election period (Pastor-Galindo et al., et al., 2020).

Moreover, using Twitter (X-Land) APIs and tools like Botometer has enabled the identification of social bots within political discussions on the platform (Pastor-Galindo et al., 2020). Researchers have expanded their understanding of bot behavior and its impact on political discourse by collecting data on bot accounts, including their followers and friends lists (Pastor-Galindo. This data collection effort from the University of Murcia provides a valuable resource for studying social bot activity during the 2019 Spanish general election (Pastor-Galindo et al., 2020).

Political campaigns have indeed changed in the digital age, significantly driven by the growth in digital media, especially social networking platforms. Researchers prove that digital campaigning has changed traditional political campaign processes (Muswede, 2022). These new platforms, from Facebook and Twitter (X-Land) to Reddit, have changed the nature of political campaigns, how one gets and shares information, and how people connect with politics (Dimitrova & Matthes, 2018).

The impact of the digital campaign strategies was most prominent during presidential elections, ranging from influencing public opinion to customers' choices on the ballot (Sahlan, 2023). It has also been argued that the communication strategy of political parties has been

more influenced by grassroots activists, making a change in political culture digitally based with consequences for the partisan organization and mobilization (Lobera & Portos, 2021). This integration of digital tools, from data collection to voter targeting, is commonly used in modern campaigning, as has been done in U.S. campaigns (Jungherr, 2016).

The rise of digital campaigning has also fostered new types of citizen-initiated campaigns, breaking traditional models of campaign management, each one easily empowering grassroots movements (Gibson, 2015). Then again, it is not a figure that comes without its challenges, ensuring that ethical standards and values of justice are held high amidst the surge of digital campaigning (Razak & Amin, 2023). Valid, the new phase in political campaigning was unofficially defined by this dependence on digital technology, big data, networked communication, and micro-targeting of campaign messages. (Roemmele & Gibson, 2020).

Social media has been an essential change agent in political campaigns in Indonesia and Spain in the digital era. Regarding the communication strategy, social media sets it up in both countries and involves the voters. Those changes redesigned not only the conventional ways of campaigning but also opened new challenges related to ethics and management of digital literacy. Even as political scenarios change, digital tools and strategies will retain a core place in shaping future political discourses and participation: how technology and politics dance.

Method

With that respect, the digital transformation of political campaigns will be reviewed in Indonesia and Spain, following a comparative case study approach. The study will secondarily base its analysis on academic literature, official reports, and social media analytics. In the Indonesian case, this research focuses on both the 2019 and 2020 elections, anchoring its study on social media use by political parties and candidates regarding strategies of digital theocracy and extensive data integration. In Spain, the focus falls on the 2015 and 2019 elections, mainly on social media and digital tools in campaign strategies. The analysis uses Twitter (X-Land) data covering political hashtags and social bots. It also includes analyzing data from the University of Valencia regarding voter beliefs and intentions. Content data analysis tools and social media analytics were utilized to measure the engagement and the impact of digital campaigns, underlining the similarities and differences in digital campaign strategies between these two countries.

Result And Discussion

1. Transformation of Political Campaigns in Indonesia

Indeed, digitizing political campaigns has drastically changed Indonesia's political communication and engagement scene. Political parties and candidates heavily exploited Twitter (X-Land) and Facebook to reach out to voters in the 2019 and 2020 elections (Gusfa & Kadjuand, 2020). Due to health protocol constraints, online campaigning was the only way to reach voters and spread political messages. Voter turnout in metropolitan areas has been significantly boosted by digital campaigning, particularly in the upcoming 2020 Depok City Election. To harness the power of digital platforms to rally voters, it is essential to implement strategies that increase political engagement in urban areas (Siti Maryam et al., 2022). Digital campaigns have impacted public opinion and voting behavior by increasing voter involvement and, by extension, the reach of information and political messaging (Sahlan, 2023). According to (Saraswati, 2018), the political campaign sector in Indonesia has become more commercialized due to the use of social media in campaigns. Online politics and the usage of social media for political communication have become increasingly important in modern electoral campaigns due to this (Fadhlorrohman & Purnomo, 2020). Campaign speech and narratives have also been significantly impacted by the rise of WhatsAppification and memetic persuasion (Baulch et al., 2024). In addition, it has been observed in Indonesian political campaigns recently that black campaigns, which spread false and negative information, are joint (Abdullah et al., 2019). Voter attitudes and actions can be swayed by these campaigns that seek to mold public opinion about candidates (Jubba, 2023). The digital campaign scene has

been further heightened by supporters' usage of viral political content on social media. As a result, political actors must master the complexity of online political discourse (Damayanti et al., 2021).

2. Digital Theocracy Strategies

Digital tactics and big data analytics have significantly influenced voter mood and engagement within contemporary political campaigns. Online tactics that could sway public opinion and votes were employed by the 2024 presidential campaign, as reported, including the publication of religious quotations, attendance at religious events, and alliance formation with spiritual leaders. The use of digital technology by political operators could influence voter behavior and decisions, according to (Karunian et al., 2019). These technological advancements can potentially engage more people, reach more demographics, generate more revenue, and strengthen grassroots efforts. Campaigns can now use many opportunities made possible by the proliferation of big data.

The rise of digital platforms and big data has revolutionized political parties' outreach to voters. Personalization of messages, reduction of ideological emphasis, and a surge in negative campaigning are all part of this (Dobber et al., 2017). Furthermore, as per (García-Orosa, 2021), using A.I., big data, and social media has resulted in a novel digital democracy. Dissemination of misinformation, participation from audiences at national and international levels, and the rise of digital democracies are the hallmarks of this new era. All of these things pose risks to democratic procedures. Using big data in political communication analysis has improved campaign outreach and messages (Dobber et al., 2017). The outcome is more exact approaches for electorate segmentation and targeting. Using social media analytics and the trend toward micro-targeting with individually identifiable information, political campaigns have cast doubt on citizens' right to privacy and the integrity of public discourse (Dobber et al., 2017).

3. Technical and social challenges in conducting digital campaigns.

During the 2020 Simultaneous Regional Elections in Indonesia, digital campaigning encountered considerable obstacles because of the COVID-19 epidemic. Due to health protocol limits, online campaigns became the primary way political candidates communicated with voters (Prasetyo et al., 2024). Technical issues range from connectivity problems to a lack of digital literacy to changing campaign strategies to online platforms. Social ends could include norms, public opinion related to digital campaigns, and perceptions of the effectiveness of digital communication in reaching voters.

The pandemic has brought to the forefront the exacting task of dealing with social issues alongside technological ones in Indonesia's shift to digital campaigns. This will require deep insight into the digital landscape, strategic communication plans, and public education and awareness campaigns that drive digital literacy. On this count, political actors must manage the ever-shifting political climate and harness voters effectively by pinpointing and solving the issues related to their respective digital campaigns. During the 2020 Simultaneous Regional Elections in Indonesia, digital campaigning encountered considerable obstacles because of the COVID-19 epidemic. Due to health protocol limits, online campaigns became the primary way political candidates communicated with voters (Prasetyo et al., 2024). Technical issues range from connectivity problems to a lack of digital literacy to changing campaign strategies to online platforms. Social ends could include norms, public opinion related to digital campaigns, and perceptions of the effectiveness of digital communication in reaching voters.

The pandemic has brought to the forefront the exacting task of dealing with social issues alongside technological ones in Indonesia's shift to digital campaigns. This will require deep insight into the digital landscape, strategic communication plans, and public education and awareness campaigns that drive digital literacy. On this count, political actors must manage the ever-shifting political climate and harness voters effectively by pinpointing and solving the issues related to their respective digital campaigns.

4. Politics of S.A.R.A. and Threats to Virtual Public Spaces

There is a grave threat to Indonesian national unity and the philosophy of Pancasila through the politicization of the issues of S.A.R.A., Tribe, Religion, Race, and Intergroup. The hoax allows the basics of Indonesia to be changed when there are controversies, discontent from the public, sectarian animosity, intolerance, political instability, and security problems regarding S.A.R.A. subjects (Dobber et al., 2017). The threat, however, is accelerated by the increase in hate speech across social media platforms, particularly in Indonesia, where religion-state relations are often discussed, leading to expressions of divisive rhetoric, *sui generis* inflammatory, which challenges freedom of expression and public space on these digital platforms (Dobber et al., 2017)

In this regard, understanding the impact of social media on SARA-related hoaxes and hate speech increases the urgency to regulate online campaigns and understand their relation to political financing in Asia and the Pacific. Regulations should be implemented to end the spread of misinformation, hate speech, and anything else dividing people into online public spaces to ensure democratic values and principles and the legitimacy of online political processes.

5. Regulation of Digital Campaigns and Political Finance

These items offer the opportunity to discern the standards for digital campaigns and political funding in the Asia-Pacific. (Tham et al., 2022) examining the shape and character of the region, and digital campaigning by testing the law through political financing rules. State governments use expenditure limits and disclosure requirements in their campaign finance regulation. (Dobber et al., 2017) Measure the stringency of state legislation related to contributions to campaigns. As potential mitigation for ensuring democratic processes are fulfilled, the study authors discuss the possibility of regulating online campaign finance. The following could shed some light on regulating digital campaigns and political donations within the Asia-Pacific region.

(Tham et al., 2022) contribute to digital campaigns and ways of political finance laws that regulate them through case studies in Indonesia, Japan, Australia, and Kyrgyzstan. Online campaign financing is an area that needs regulation to keep elections safe from this scourge of disinformation and polarization. Agrawal et al. state, "Especially the ethical considerations due to uncontrolled online campaign media point to the need for a Code of Ethics for Digital Campaigns" (Razak & Amin, 2023). Fair elections require more power for the police; laws to keep foreign money from influencing campaign finances are needed (Kume, 2023). This would ensure that elections across the Asia-Pacific region are transparent, accountable, and accessible through stringent laws that regulate financing for politics and digital campaigns.

6. Transformation of Political Campaigns in Spain

Both the economic crisis and the elections above, as well as the further exploitation of social media, are the causes behind visible changes in the evolution of political campaigning in Spain. The parties and the candidates are slowly adapting to these new campaign conditions by applying digital tools and platforms to reach voters and framing the political discourse. Twitter (X-Land) datasets provide a closer understanding of political communication and social bots' presence, such as evidence for a drift towards more technologically driven campaign strategies. According to research (Gibson, 2015), digital media gives rise to grassroots-based modes of campaigning, thus constituting populations of flows that push at the boundaries of traditional models of campaign management whereby it empowers grass-roots initiatives; hence, there is a seismic shift towards 'citizen-initiated campaigning,' a situation that Levels to decentralization of power within campaigns. It is also the contention of (Bene, 2023) that social media platforms equalize political competition due to more accessible and more level campaign interfaces for various political actors, hence reshaping the political landscapes. Moreover, the prevalence of "fake news" in political campaigns raises concerns over the integrity of elections and the legitimacy of elected officials argued by (Lee, 2019). Digital channels have changed the nature of campaigning by spreading disinformation, thereby foregrounding the importance of mechanisms against disinformation to protect the transparency of electoral processes. Online campaigning in Spain goes the same way, according

Muhamad Jamal et al (Transformation of Political Campaigns in the Digital Era: Case Studies of Indonesia and Spain)

to (Vanden Eynde et al., 2023): the development of interconnection between online and offline campaign tools has taken a turn, proving that digital tools have been normalized within the political sphere. Given this, integrating these digital tools has been realized as crucial for parties to effectively reach and engage voters to influence public opinion and electoral outcomes.

7. Data Collection and Election Outcome Prediction

Researchers have used various data collection techniques and tools to predict election outcomes. The Elections and Public Opinion Research Group from the University of Valencia has employed surveys and online data collection methods (Jain & Kumar, 2017). Additionally, the identification and analysis of social bot behavior have been conducted using tools like Botometer (Rossi et al., 2020). Social media data have been explored for predicting election results, with studies indicating the feasibility and simplicity of computing electoral outcomes from social media data (Metaxas et al., 2011). Furthermore, the impact of factors on predicting parliamentary election outcomes has been assessed using heuristic methods and algorithmic models (Beqiri et al., 2022). Studies have shown that social bots can significantly impact the outcomes of national events, including elections (Yang et al., 2019). The use of social bots in election campaigns has been investigated, revealing an increase in their share during election periods (Keller & Klinger, 2019). Moreover, social bots in elections have been observed, with a notable amount actively participating and supporting political parties (Pastor-Galindo et al. et al., 2020). The manipulation of public opinion through social bots has become prevalent, with these bots being considered capable of distributing propaganda and influencing election results (Grimme et al., 2017). Scholars have been interested in understanding how political bots affect public opinion, election outcomes, and the public sphere (Tosyali, 2021). Additionally, users' susceptibility to interact with social bots on platforms like Twitter (X-Land) has been examined, with factors like friend count and follower count identified as predictors of susceptibility (Liu, 2019).

8. Challenges of Digital Campaigns in Spain

To effectively address the challenges of digital campaigns in Spain, it is essential to consider the issues of sample representativeness and respondent anonymity in voter opinion surveys and the impact of social bots on political discourse and voter engagement on social media. Ensuring sample representativeness in surveys is crucial for obtaining accurate insights into voter opinions (Cormack, 2019). However, achieving this can be challenging due to potential biases in the sample selection process. Maintaining respondent anonymity is equally important to encourage honest responses and protect individuals' privacy (Cormack, 2019).

The political discourse analysis on social media is significantly influenced by the presence of social bots, which can distort conversations and manipulate voter engagement (Keller & Klinger, 2019). Social bots have been observed to increase in prevalence during election campaigns, impacting the information shared and the overall discourse (Keller & Klinger, 2019). Understanding the behavior of social bots and their potential to spread propaganda is crucial for maintaining the integrity of political discussions online (Grimme et al., 2017).

Research has shown that social media platforms significantly shape political attitudes and behaviors (Bail et al., 2020). The use of social media for political communication has raised concerns about the spread of disinformation and the manipulation of public opinion (Rossetti & Zaman, 2023). Automated accounts, such as social bots, have been identified as critical actors in spreading false information and influencing online discussions (Rossetti & Zaman, 2023).

Moreover, the use of social media in political campaigns has highlighted the need to assess the representativeness of online platforms compared to the general population (Mellon & Prosser, 2017). Studies have indicated that social media users may not fully represent the diversity of the population, leading to potential biases in understanding voter behavior and attitudes (Mellon & Prosser, 2017). Recognizing these limitations is essential for accurately

interpreting data collected from social media platforms.

9. Implications of Digital Transformation on Political Campaigns

Digital transformation has significantly impacted political campaigns, influencing public communication and democratization. The digitalization shift has revolutionized how political parties communicate with the public, mobilize supporters, and engage in electoral processes (Muswede, 2022). This transformation has led to a more decentralized approach to electoral campaigns, with grassroots activists playing a more significant role in shaping political strategies through digital activism (Muswede, 2022). The use of digital platforms has not only altered the traditional methods of political communication but has also influenced the mobilization and polarisation of political parties in democracies (Muswede, 2022).

Moreover, the rise of digital campaigns has raised ethical challenges and highlighted the importance of digital literacy in understanding the use of technology in politics (Nord & Grusell, 2019). As online campaigns become central to democratic politics, ensuring inclusivity and accessibility in digital political participation is crucial, especially for marginalized and politically vulnerable populations (Nord & Grusell, 2019). The ethical considerations in digital campaigning encompass data privacy, transparency in online political messaging, and the responsible use of digital tools for political purposes (Nord & Grusell, 2019).

The impact of digital transformation on political campaigns extends to the democratization process, where the use of digital media technologies, mainly social media networks, has transformed traditional political thought processes involved in leadership campaigns (Razak & Amin, 2023). Democratizing political communication through digital platforms has enabled more significant interaction between politicians and citizens, facilitating direct engagement and feedback mechanisms (Razak & Amin, 2023). However, this shift also poses challenges in maintaining ethical standards and justice values in digital campaigning, emphasizing the need for a digital campaign code of ethics (Razak & Amin, 2023).

10. Conclusions from the Comparative Study

The comparative study between Indonesia and Spain reveals similarities and differences in their digital campaign strategies. In Indonesia, qualitatively exploring emerging digital marketing trends emphasizes businesses' need to adapt to new practices (Hafidh et al., 2024). On the other hand, in Spain, there is a focus on the role of digital media and new populist parties in election campaigns, posing questions and offering new research directions (Casero-Ripollés et al., 2016). These differences in digital campaign strategies stem from varying intensity levels with which digital tools are deployed in each country (Jungherr, 2016).

Regarding the long-term implications of digitalizing political campaigns on democracy and political participation, it is evident that digital campaign strategies have become increasingly crucial in influencing public opinion and voter choices (Sahlan, 2023). The study on the impact of digital media on political campaign strategy emphasizes the importance of digital media strategies in contemporary political campaigns (Howard, 2005). Furthermore, the analysis of digital political microtargeting highlights the application of normative theories of democracy to digital contexts to design and evaluate digital practices (Odzuck & Günther, 2021).

In conclusion, Indonesia and Spain's digital campaign strategies exhibit unique approaches and shared challenges. The long-term implications of digitalization on democracy underscore the evolving landscape of political communication and the significant role digital media plays in shaping public opinion and political participation.

Table 1. Differences in the transformation of political campaigns in Indonesia and Spain in the digital era:

Aspect	Indonesia	Spain
--------	-----------	-------

Digital Adoption	High adoption of social media platforms (Twitter (X-Land), Facebook).	Extensive use of social media platforms (Twitter (X-Land), Facebook).
Election Case Studies	2019 and 2020 elections.	2015 and 2019 elections.
Digital Campaign Strategies	Digital theocracy strategies, use of big data, memetic persuasion, WhatsAppification.	Focus on social media data (Twitter (X-Land)) and social bots.
Challenges	Digital literacy, connectivity issues, negative campaigns, S.A.R.A. issues.	Sample representativeness, anonymity in surveys, misinformation.
Impact on Voter Participation	It increased urban voter participation and mobilization through digital platforms.	Influence of social media on voter engagement and public opinion.
Use of Big Data	Integrated for personalized messaging and mobilization efforts.	Utilized to analyze social media behavior and election predictions.
Regulation	Emphasis on addressing digital campaign dysfunctions and regulation of digital campaigns.	Focus on ethical standards, transparency in digital campaigning, and addressing fake news.
Research Focus	Impact of digital campaigns on urban political participation and public opinion.	Study of social bots, digital communication strategies, and electoral outcomes.
Technological Tools	Social media platforms, big data analytics, A.I. in campaigns.	Twitter (X-Land) APIs and a Botometer are used to identify social bots.
Public Opinion & Communication	Significant influence on public communication and democratization.	Substantial impact on political discourse and public communication through digital platforms.

The role of digital media in political campaigns is very different in Indonesia from that in Spain. In the Indonesian elections, the record of adoptions in 2019 and 2020 was relatively high, utilizing social media platforms like Twitter (X-Land) and Facebook. Some strategies employed in the campaigns included digital theocracy, integration of big data, memetic persuasion, and WhatsApp. These are challenges related to digital literacy, connectivity problems, negative campaigning, and SARA-related issues. The digital campaigns were made possible through digital platforms, urbanizing the most mobilized voters. Big data helps to establish personalized messaging and mobilization efforts. From a regulatory viewpoint, the dysfunctions of digital campaigns have been focused on regulation. Electoral finance is conducted mainly through digital means. In Spain, 2015 and 2019 have already become milestone elections concerning social media-chosen focus, specifically Twitter (X-Land) and the intervention of social bots.

Challenges include ensuring sample representativeness, maintaining survey anonymity, and combating misinformation. Social media plays a critical role in voter engagement and the formation of public opinion. Big data helps analyze social media behavior and predicts election outcomes. Ethical standards and transparency in digital campaigns: Mechanisms to check the circulation of fake news. The system indicates that both countries somewhat bend towards digital communication strategies and advanced technological tools during political campaigns.

11. Recommendations for Political Campaigns in the Digital Era

In the digital era, political campaigns have undergone significant transformations due to the increasing influence of online media on political communication, public participation, and election outcomes (Febrianto & Devi Purnamasari, 2023). With the evolution of political communication strategies, there is a notable shift towards personal, participatory narratives in campaigns, allowing for more significant influence from individuals and communities on political movements (West, 2022). The rise of the digital native generation has further emphasized the importance of the digital space in political campaigns, as this generation forms a substantial base of novice voters (Prasetyo et al., 2024).

Politicians have increasingly turned to digital platforms like Twitter (X-Land) to engage with potential voters and address political issues, marking a shift from traditional media as the primary communication channel (Muswede, 2022). Digital tools have become integral in modern election campaigns, offering innovative ways for parties to connect with voters and enhance campaign effectiveness (Jungherr, 2016). Digital technologies have become common worldwide political campaigning, reshaping traditional campaign norms (Fischer & Gilardi, 2023).

Regulations and policies supporting fair and transparent digital campaigns are crucial in maintaining ethical standards and justice values in elections (Razak & Amin, 2023). The use of digital media in campaigns has not only modernized mainstream political parties but has also paved the way for new challengers and altered the campaigning landscape (Hartleb, 2013). The impact of digitally driven changes in political campaigning has prompted candidates to adapt and find new ways to engage with voters digitally (Arbay et al., 2021).

Overall, the digital age has revolutionized political campaigns, necessitating a deep understanding of voter preferences, demographic dynamics, and local issues to run effective and transparent campaigns (Septiana et al., 2024). As digital media continues to shape political communication and campaign strategies, regulations must evolve to ensure fairness, transparency, and ethical conduct in digital campaigns (Tham et al., 2022).

Conclusion

Digital results have changed political campaigns in Indonesia and Spain regarding political communication and public participation. Currently, in Indonesia, campaigns have primarily relied on digital media since the outbreak of COVID-19 to reach urban voters through social media and digital skills. The widespread use of social media analytics and social bots has already been exposed in Spain, raising concerns over misinformation and ethical practices in digital campaigns. This change shows how digital campaign strategies will continue to increase voter participation, make communication more efficient, and turn toward big data for effective, target-oriented messaging. It also brings challenges, such as regulations over ethical concerns and misinformation issues related to digital literacy campaigns. No doubt, with the advancement in technology, a political campaign will, more than ever before, rely much on tools and strategies in the digital space. Fair, transparent, ethical digital campaign regulations should be squarely developed to enhance democratic participation and informed voter choices.

References

- Abdullah, I., Wahyono, S. B., & Persadha, P. D. (2019). AUDIENCE CULTURE IN THE RECEPTION OF TEXT: BLACK CAMPAIGNS ON ONLINE MEDIA DURING INDONESIA'S 2014 AND 2019

- PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 7(1), 493–500. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.7156>
- Arbay, E. A., Pasha, J. A., & Widodo, A. S. (2021). The Consequences of Digitally Driven Changes in Political Campaigning for Democratic Societies: A Case Study of the 2020 US Presidential Election. *Journal of Social and Political Sciences*, 4(4). <https://doi.org/10.31014/aior.1991.04.04.312>
- Bail, C. A., Guay, B., Maloney, E., Combs, A., Hillygus, D. S., Merhout, F., Freelon, D., & Volfovsky, A. (2020). Assessing the Russian Internet Research Agency's impact on the political attitudes and behaviors of American Twitter users in late 2017. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 117(1), 243–250. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1906420116>
- Baulch, E., Matamoros-Fernández, A., & Suwana, F. (2024). Memetic persuasion and WhatsAppification in Indonesia's 2019 presidential election. *New Media & Society*, 26(5), 2473–2491. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14614448221088274>
- Bene, M. (2023). Who reaps the benefits? A cross-country investigation of the absolute and relative normalization and equalization theses in the 2019 European Parliament elections. *New Media & Society*, 25(7), 1708–1727. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14614448211019688>
- Beqiri, L., Fetaji, M., Fetaji, B., & Zdravev, Z. (2022). Assessing the Impacting Factors in Prediction of Parliamentary Elections Turnout Using Heuristics and Devising MIP Algorithmic Model. 2022 International Conference on Computing, Networking, Telecommunications & Engineering Sciences Applications (CoNTESA), 57–61. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CoNTESA57046.2022.10011395>
- Casero-Ripollés, A., Feenstra, R. A., & Tormey, S. (2016). Old and New Media Logics in an Electoral Campaign. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 21(3), 378–397. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161216645340>
- Cormack, L. (2019). Leveraging Peer-to-Peer Connections to Increase Voter Participation in Local Elections. *Politics & Policy*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/polp.12297>
- Damayanti, N., Santoso, P., & Hamzah, R. (2021). Viral political Campaign: Suppoters of Jokowi-Amin in Indonesia Presidential Election. *Proceedings of the 1st ICA Regional Conference, ICA 2019, October 16-17 2019, Bali, Indonesia*. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.16-10-2019.2304290>
- Dhosa Kadju, F., & Gusfa, H. (2021). The Battle of SARA Politicization as a Threat to Virtual Public Spaces and Indonesian Cyber- Democracy (Semiotics Analysis on 2019 Presidential Election Campaign Narrative on Twitter between The Incumbent and The Opposite). *Proceedings of the 1st MICOSS Mercu Buana International Conference on Social Sciences, MICOSS 2020, September 28-29, 2020, Jakarta, Indonesia*. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.28-9-2020.2307498>
- Dimitrova, D. V., & Matthes, J. (2018). Social Media in Political Campaigning Around the World: Theoretical and Methodological Challenges. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 95(2), 333–342. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077699018770437>
- Dobber, T., Trilling, D., Helberger, N., & de Vreese, C. H. (2017). Two crates of beer and 40 pizzas: the adoption of innovative political behavioural targeting techniques. *Internet Policy Review*, 6(4), 102–122. <https://doi.org/10.14763/2017.4.777>
- Fadhlurrohman, M. I., & Purnomo, E. P. (2020). The role of online mass media as a tool for the 2019 political campaign in Indonesia. *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi (Indonesian Journal of Communications Studies)*, 4(2), 311. <https://doi.org/10.25139/jsk.v4i2.2182>
- Fadillah, D., Zheng-lin, L., & Hao, D. G. (2019). Big Data and the Revolution of Political Campaign in Indonesia. <https://doi.org/10.2991/adics-elssh-19.2019.19>
- Febrianto, A., & Devi Purnamasari. (2023). A, The, Of ANALYSIS INSTAGRAM CONTENT IN THE POLITICAL COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES OF THE 2024 INDONESIA PRESIDENTIAL CANDIDATES. *Sociae Polites*, 24(2), 47–65. <https://doi.org/10.33541/sp.v24i2.5403>
- Fischer, M., & Gilardi, F. (2023). Level Playing Field or Politics as Usual? Equalization–Normalization in Direct Democratic Online Campaigns. *Media and Communication*, 11(1), 43–55. <https://doi.org/10.17645/mac.v11i1.6004>

- García-Orosa, B. (2021). Disinformation, social media, bots, and astroturfing: the fourth wave of digital democracy. *El Profesional de La Información*. <https://doi.org/10.3145/epi.2021.nov.03>
- Gibson, R. K. (2015). Party change, social media and the rise of 'citizen-initiated' campaigning. *Party Politics*, 21(2), 183–197. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354068812472575>
- Grimme, C., Preuss, M., Adam, L., & Trautmann, H. (2017). Social Bots: Human-Like by Means of Human Control? *Big Data*, 5(4), 279–293. <https://doi.org/10.1089/big.2017.0044>
- Gusfa, H., & Kadjuand, F. E. D. (2020). Political Agonism for Indonesian Cyberpolitic: Critical Cyberculture to Political Campaign of 2019 Indonesian Presidential Election in Twitter. *Nyimak: Journal of Communication*, 4(2), 211. <https://doi.org/10.31000/nyimak.v4i2.2685>
- Hafidh, A. A. H. N., Rahayu, A., & Hendrayati, H. (2024). Digital Marketing Trends and Innovations in Indonesia: A Qualitative Exploration of Emerging Practices. *Kontigensi: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 12(1), 50–53. <https://doi.org/10.56457/jimk.v12i1.517>
- Hartleb, F. (2013). Digital Campaigning and the Growing Anti-Elitism: The Pirates and Beppe Grillo. *European View*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12290-013-0252-8>
- Howard, P. N. (2005). Deep Democracy, Thin Citizenship: The Impact of Digital Media in Political Campaign Strategy. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716204270139>
- Jain, V. K., & Kumar, S. (2017). Towards Prediction of Election Outcomes Using Social Media. *International Journal of Intelligent Systems and Applications*, 9(12), 20–28. <https://doi.org/10.5815/ijisa.2017.12.03>
- Jubba, H. (2023). Cues That Matter: The Potential for Black Campaigns in the 2024 General Election. *Khazanah Sosial*. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ks.v5i3.26099>
- Jungherr, A. (2016). Four Functions of Digital Tools in Election Campaigns. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 21(3), 358–377. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161216642597>
- Karunian, A. Y., Halme, H., & Söderholm, A.-M. (2019). Data Profiling and Elections: Has Data-Driven Political Campaign Gone Too Far? *Udayana Journal of Law and Culture*. <https://doi.org/10.24843/ujlc.2019.v03.i01.p05>
- Keller, T. R., & Klinger, U. (2019). Social Bots in Election Campaigns: Theoretical, Empirical, and Methodological Implications. *Political Communication*, 36(1), 171–189. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2018.1526238>
- Kume, A. (2023). Legislative Solution to Prevent the Interference of Foreign Financing in the Electoral Campaign and their Destabilizing Effects. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Research and Development*, 10(1 S1), 126. <https://doi.org/10.56345/ijrdv10n1s118>
- Kurniawati, F., Pawito, P., & Muktiyo, W. (2019). New Media in Political Marketing of Governor Election (Evidence in East Java, Indonesia). *Proceedings of the International Conference on Emerging Media, and Social Science*. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.7-12-2018.2281767>
- Lee, T. (2019). The global rise of “fake news” and the threat to democratic elections in the USA. *Public Administration and Policy*, 22(1), 15–24. <https://doi.org/10.1108/PAP-04-2019-0008>
- Liu, X. (2019). A Big Data Approach to Examining Social Bots on Twitter. *Journal of Services Marketing*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jsm-02-2018-0049>
- Lobera, J., & Portos, M. (2021). Decentralizing electoral campaigns? New-old parties, grassroots and digital activism. *Information, Communication & Society*, 24(10), 1419–1440. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369118X.2020.1749697>
- Mellon, J., & Prosser, C. (2017). Twitter and Facebook are not representative of the general population: Political attitudes and demographics of British social media users. *Research & Politics*, 4(3), 205316801772000. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2053168017720008>
- Metaxas, P. T., Mustafaraj, E., & Gayo-Avello, D. (2011). How (Not) to Predict Elections. 2011 IEEE Third Int'l Conference on Privacy, Security, Risk and Trust and 2011 IEEE Third Int'l Conference on Social Computing, 165–171. <https://doi.org/10.1109/PASSAT/SocialCom.2011.98>
- Muswede, T. (2022). Impact of Digital Media on Political Campaigns. *African Journal of Political Science*, 10(1), 41–50. <https://doi.org/10.36615/ajpsrasp.v10i1.1152>

- Nord, L., & Grusell, M. (2019). 30-second politics, 30 years too late: Political TV advertising in Swedish election campaigns, 2006–2018. *Central European Journal of Communication*, 12(3), 282–298. [https://doi.org/10.19195/1899-5101.12.3\(24\).1](https://doi.org/10.19195/1899-5101.12.3(24).1)
- Odzuck, E., & Günther, S. (2021). Digital Campaigning as A policy of Democracy Promotion: Applying Deliberative Theories of Democracy to Political Parties. *Zeitschrift Für Politikwissenschaft*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41358-021-00308-w>
- Pastor-Galindo, J., Zago, M., Nespoli, P., Bernal, S. L., Celdrán, A. H., Pérez, M. G., Ruipérez-Valiente, J. A., Pérez, G. M., & Mármol, F. G. (2020). Spotting Political Social Bots in Twitter: A Use Case of the 2019 Spanish General Election. *IEEE Transactions on Network and Service Management*, 17(4), 2156–2170. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TNSM.2020.3031573>
- Pastor-Galindo, J., Zago, M., Nespoli, P., López Bernal, S., Huertas Celdrán, A., Gil Pérez, M., Ruipérez-Valiente, J. A., Martínez Pérez, G., & Gómez Mármol, F. (2020). Twitter social bots: The 2019 Spanish general election data. *Data in Brief*, 32, 106047. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2020.106047>
- Pavía, J. M., Coll-Serrano, V., Cuñat-Giménez, R., & Carrasco-Arroyo, S. (2020). Data from the GIPEyOP online election poll for the 2015 Spanish General election. *Data in Brief*, 31. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2020.105719>
- Prasetyo, K. B., Rahardjo, T., & Sardini, N. H. (2024). Digital Campaign Dysfunction in Indonesian Regional Election During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *International Journal of Research and Review*, 11(3), 345–359. <https://doi.org/10.52403/ijrr.20240344>
- Razak, A., & Amin, F. (2023). ELECTIONS AND THE DIGITAL CAMPAIGN CODE OF ETHICS: EFFORTS TO CREATE A CAMPAIGN BASED ON DIGNIFIED JUSTICE. *Awang Long Law Review*, 6(1), 295–303. <https://doi.org/10.56301/awl.v6i1.1098>
- Roemmele, A., & Gibson, R. (2020). Scientific and subversive: The two faces of the fourth era of political campaigning. *New Media & Society*, 22(4), 595–610. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444819893979>
- Rossetti, M., & Zaman, T. (2023). Bots, disinformation, and the first impeachment of U.S. President Donald Trump. *PLOS ONE*, 18(5), e0283971. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0283971>
- Rossi, S., Rossi, M., Upreti, B., & Liu, Y. (2020). Detecting Political Bots on Twitter during the 2019 Finnish Parliamentary Election. <https://doi.org/10.24251/HICSS.2020.298>
- Sahlan, M. (2023). Digital Theocracy Strategy In The 2024 Presidential Election Campaign: Its Influence On Public Opinion And Voter Choice. *Eduvest - Journal of Universal Studies*, 3(10), 1883–1891. <https://doi.org/10.59188/eduvest.v3i10.936>
- Salma, A. N. (2019). Defining Digital Literacy in the Age of Computational Propaganda and Hate Spin Politics. *KnE Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v3i20.4945>
- Saraswati, M. S. (2018). Social Media and the Political Campaign Industry in Indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi Ikatan Sarjana Komunikasi Indonesia*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.25008/jkiskisi.v3i1.124>
- Septiana, E., Rahman, A. B. A., & Manaf, K. (2024). Development and Analysis of GIS Regional Political Profiles in West Java Utilizing the Spatial Overlay Join Method. *CoreID Journal*, 2(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.60005/coreid.v2i1.25>
- Siti Maryam, Wahidin, D. T. S., & Zempi, C. N. (2022). Digital Campaign to Increase Urban Political Participation (Study on the 2020 Pilkada in Depok City). *Proceedings Of International Conference On Communication Science*, 2(1), 605–613. <https://doi.org/10.29303/iccsproceeding.v2i1.106>
- Tham, J.-C., Carson, A., Aman, A., Chinnappa, A., McClean, C. T., & Omurkulova-Ozierska, E. (2022). Digital Campaigning and Political Finance in the Asia and the Pacific Region: A New Age for an Old Problem. *International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance (International IDEA)*. <https://doi.org/10.31752/idea.2022.37>
- Tosyali, H. (2021). Political Communication in the Digital Age: Algorithms and Bots. <https://doi.org/10.17932/ctcspc.21/ctc21.004>

-
- Vanden Eynde, G., Put, G.-J., & Maddens, B. (2023). The coming of age for paid digital campaigning: equalization or normalization in the 2019 Belgian federal elections? *Online Information Review*, 47(4), 749–764. <https://doi.org/10.1108/OIR-12-2021-0679>
- West, R. (2022). For the Many (But Especially for You) : The Personal, Participatory Narratives of Videos Supporting the UK Labour Party's 2017 Election Campaign. <https://doi.org/10.32920/ryerson.14647770.v1>
- Widayat, R. M., Nurmandi, A., Rosilawati, Y., Nashir, H., Jubba, H., & Baharuddin, T. (2022). Differences in Campaign Strategy Between “Indonesian Work” and “Indonesia Adil Makmur” Via Twitter in The 2019 Election. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.220705.008>
- Yang, K.-C., Hui, P.-M., & Menczer, F. (2019). Bot Electioneering Volume: Visualizing Social Bot Activity During Elections. *Companion Proceedings of The 2019 World Wide Web Conference*, 214–217. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3308560.3316499>