

Competitiveness Analysis of Umrah Products at a Leading Conventional Travel Agents in Bandung City

Rifansyah Faturahman ^{a,1}, Rikantini Widiyanti ^{b,2,*}^a Tour and Travel Business Study Program, Politeknik Negeri Bandung, Indonesia^{*b} Tour and Travel Business Study Program, Politeknik Negeri Bandung, Indonesia¹ rifansyah.faturahman.upw23@polban.ac.id; ² rikantini@polban.ac.id;

*Correspondent Author; Email Author

ARTICLE INFO

Article history

Received:

15-06-2026

Revised:

23-07-2026

Accepted:

30-08-2026

Keywords

Competitiveness, Umrah

Products, 7P Marketing

Mix, Consumer

Perception, Travel Agent

ABSTRACT

The Indonesian umrah travel industry has grown rapidly over the past three years, intensifying competition among Umrah Pilgrimage Travel Organizers (PPIU) and requiring travel agencies to build measurable, consumer-based competitive advantages. Prior studies on the 7P Marketing Mix in the umrah and broader tourism sector have mostly tested the framework's influence on downstream outcomes such as satisfaction or loyalty through inferential modeling, while fewer studies use 7P scores directly as a diagnostic tool for formulating actionable strategy at the level of a single travel agency. This study addresses that gap by measuring the competitiveness of the umrah products offered by a conventional travel agency (PT. X) in Bandung City from the consumer's perspective, and by translating the resulting score pattern directly into prioritized business development strategies. A descriptive quantitative approach was employed using a 30-item questionnaire built on the seven dimensions of the 7P Marketing Mix (Product, Price, Place, Promotion, People, Process, Physical Evidence), measured on a 1-4 Likert scale and administered to 31 prospective umrah pilgrims selected through purposive sampling. The overall results show in "Good" category, with Physical Evidence as the strongest dimension and Promotion as the weakest -- the only dimension not yet reaching the "Good" category. Based on this score pattern, three priority strategic pillars were formulated: (1) strengthening digital promotion and marketing; (2) diversifying and differentiating umrah products; and (3) improving human resource competence and umrah-specific service standards. This study contributes empirical, consumer-data-based evidence as a practical foundation for strategic decision-making among small and mid-sized umrah travel agencies, while acknowledging the limits to generalizability associated with a small, single-firm, non-probability sample.

This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY-SA](#) license.



Introduction

The umrah travel industry in Indonesia continues to experience significant growth. According to Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia (2024), as cited in AMPHURI (2025), the number of officially registered Umrah Pilgrimage Travel Organizers (PPIU) reached 906 by the end of 2024, with the largest concentration -- 52% -- located on the island of Java; more recent industry monitoring places the number of active PPIU above 2,500 by April 2025 (GoodStats, 2025), illustrating how quickly this administrative figure changes and underscoring the importance of stating the reference period whenever such regulatory data is cited. Regardless of the exact count, this expanding and increasingly fragmented market creates a highly competitive landscape in which every travel agency must possess measurable, data-driven advantages (Battour & Ismail, 2016).

PT. X is a tourism travel agency currently developing an umrah business line as a form of service diversification. Although it already holds a reputation in the general tourism segment, PT. X's umrah products have not yet shown optimal sales performance. A comparison of prices for the regular 9-day umrah package shows that PT. X sets the highest price, at Rp 33,900,000, compared with three benchmark travel agencies: Travel A (Rp 31,900,000), Travel B (Rp 29,900,000), and Travel C (Rp 33,500,000). A higher price is not automatically a weakness if it is offset by superior perceived value in the eyes of pilgrims; however, this condition underscores the importance of a comprehensive understanding of the company's competitive position from the consumer's point of view.

Most existing studies on the 7P Marketing Mix in the umrah and broader tourism sector test the framework as a predictor of downstream outcomes such as satisfaction, loyalty, or profitability using inferential techniques, most often structural equation modeling (Elgarhy & Mohamed, 2023). Comparatively fewer studies use 7P scores as a direct diagnostic tool that a single travel agency can act on immediately, without an intervening layer of hypothesis testing. This study addresses that gap: rather than modeling statistical relationships between 7P dimensions and an outcome variable, it uses the observed score pattern across the seven dimensions -- distinguishing strengths from areas needing improvement -- as the direct empirical basis for formulating prioritized, implementable business strategies. This approach is intended to yield recommendations more tightly coupled to a specific firm's actual consumer data, complementing the more generalizable but operationally less specific findings typical of larger-sample inferential studies. This pattern persists even in the most recent literature: a 2026 case study of another Indonesian umrah operator similarly reports that digital promotion remains underdeveloped despite an otherwise well-implemented 7P mix, yet stops at a qualitative case description rather than a quantifiable, prioritized action plan (Nasution et al., 2026), while a 2025 systematic review of 118 studies on digital marketing in Hajj and Umrah agencies confirms that digital promotion has become the primary competitive battleground since 2023 without offering firms a diagnostic instrument for identifying which 7P dimension most urgently needs that investment (Ul Husna et al., 2025). The explicit gap this study targets, therefore, is not the absence of 7P research in the umrah sector, but the absence of a study that converts consumer-perceived 7P scores directly into a ranked, resource-constrained strategic roadmap for a single firm.

The empirical robustness of the 7P Marketing Mix as a determinant of consumer behavior has been demonstrated across a wide range of service sectors beyond tourism. In the beauty and wellness sector, Alwinie et al. (2024) found that the 7P dimensions significantly shaped consumer satisfaction and loyalty at a beauty clinic, while in the tourism-retail sector, Viona et al. (2023) showed that the marketing mix significantly influenced the purchase decisions of tourism-product buyers on the Bilibli Travel platform during the COVID-19 pandemic, using a purposive sampling design methodologically comparable to the present study. Similarly, in a destination-tourism context, Muchtar et al. (2024) reported that the Place, Promotion, People, Process, and Physical Evidence dimensions positively and significantly affected visitor loyalty at Tapandullu Beach, Mamuju Regency, although the mix's effect on satisfaction itself was constrained by inadequate visitor facilities -- a pattern that echoes the facility-dependent strength observed for Physical Evidence in the present study. Beyond tourism and retail, a recent scoping review by Rindu et al. (2025) mapped the application of the 7Ps across hospital services internationally, concluding that the framework remains a consistently relevant lens for optimizing service performance and competitiveness across highly diverse service industries, which reinforces its suitability as the analytical framework adopted here.

Within the specific context of Indonesian Hajj and Umrah travel agencies, a growing body of recent research similarly underscores the centrality of service-related constructs to pilgrim satisfaction, although most of these studies emphasize service quality and trust rather than the full 7P framework. Fadilah and Solahudin (2025), studying PT. Adhiya Tour & Travel in Bandung, found that while service quality alone did not significantly predict pilgrim satisfaction, trust did so strongly, with the two constructs jointly explaining 86.4% of the variance in satisfaction. Sulistio et al. (2024) similarly found that service quality, price, and promotion jointly influenced pilgrim satisfaction at PT. Pandi Kencana Murni, while Rachmi et al. (2025) confirmed that service, facilities, price perception, and trust collectively shape Umrah pilgrimage satisfaction. Using the more diagnostic CARTER/SERVQUAL framework, Qurani and Mulyono (2025) identified assurance, empathy, and tangibility as the most critical service gaps at SS Umrah and Travel, recommending staff training and SOP development as priority interventions -- recommendations that closely parallel the People- and Process-related strategies formulated in the present study. Collectively, these studies confirm that price, trust, service quality, and tangible evidence are recurring determinants of pilgrim satisfaction in the Indonesian umrah industry; however, they typically model these constructs as isolated predictors of satisfaction through inferential techniques within a single travel agency, rather than mapping all seven dimensions of the marketing mix comprehensively and translating the resulting pattern directly into a prioritized set of business strategies -- the specific gap this study seeks to fill.

This study aims to: (1) measure consumer perceptions of each dimension of the 7P Marketing Mix for PT. X's umrah products; (2) identify the dimensions that represent strengths and areas requiring improvement based on questionnaire scores; and (3) formulate business development strategies that can be directly implemented based on these findings.

The competitiveness of an umrah travel agency reflects its ability to maintain and improve market position through a combination of service quality, price accuracy, product differentiation, and consumer trust -- capabilities that are most reliably built and sustained through firm-specific, difficult-to-imitate resources (Barney, 1991). This industry operates within a monopolistically competitive structure, in which many businesses offer similar products but differentiate themselves through quality, reputation, and service innovation (Kotler & Keller, 2016). Measuring competitiveness from the consumer's perspective is

widely regarded as providing a more direct and actionable picture than internal company assessments, since it is ultimately consumers who determine their choices based on perceived value (Zeithaml, 1988).

The 7P Marketing Mix is a service marketing strategy framework consisting of seven elements: Product, Price, Place, Promotion, People, Process, and Physical Evidence. These seven elements collectively shape customer perception of and experience with a service, making the framework relevant as a diagnostic instrument for gauging a company's competitive position (Elgarhy & Mohamed, 2023); this is consistent with the broader service-quality literature, which holds that intangible service offerings are evaluated by consumers through a limited set of underlying quality dimensions (Parasuraman et al., 1988). In the tourism travel industry, Product encompasses the quality and variety of packages; Price concerns the alignment between price and the value offered; Place relates to service accessibility; Promotion covers the effectiveness of marketing communication; People concerns human resource competence; Process refers to operational standards; and Physical Evidence relates to the tangible evidence that supports consumer trust (Kotler et al., 2017).

The use of Likert-scale questionnaires to measure consumer perceptions across the 7P Marketing Mix dimensions is an approach widely applied in service-marketing research (Sugiyono, 2022). This approach allows researchers to identify which dimensions are already strong and which still require improvement, while providing an empirical picture of the company's competitive position from the consumer's point of view. An approach to strategy formulation based on consumer questionnaire results places the voice of the customer at the center of business development direction -- a stance that holds particular relevance in the umrah travel industry, which is highly oriented toward pilgrims' trust and religious experience (Battour & Ismail, 2016).

Method

This study employs a descriptive quantitative approach. Data were collected through a structured questionnaire and analyzed using descriptive statistics to produce a systematic picture of consumer perceptions of the competitiveness of PT. X's umrah products. The measurement results were then used directly as the basis for formulating business development strategy (Sugiyono, 2013).

The population consisted of prospective umrah pilgrims matching PT. X's target market profile. The sampling technique used was purposive sampling, with the following criteria: (1) at least 21 years of age; (2) having an interest in umrah travel products; and (3) willing to provide an assessment of the product attributes presented. The sample consisted of 31 respondents.

Because the sampling technique was purposive (non-probability) rather than random, the common heuristic that a sampling distribution approaches normality once $n \geq 30$ does not, strictly speaking, apply here, as that rule of thumb presumes probability-based sampling; even under probability sampling, recent methodological work cautions that it is an oversimplified guideline whose adequacy depends heavily on the shape of the underlying distribution (Koh & Ahad, 2020). The sample size in this study is therefore more accurately justified as a purposively selected, information-rich group meeting the study's eligibility criteria, following current guidance on reporting purposive sampling in quantitative business research (Memon et al., 2025). This is treated explicitly as a limitation of the study (see Section 5).

The instrument consisted of a 30-item questionnaire (PK1-PK30) developed based on the seven dimensions of the 7P Marketing Mix. Item distribution: Product (PK1-PK6, 6 items), Price (PK7-PK12, 6 items), Place (PK13-PK16, 4 items), Promotion (PK17-PK22, 6

items), People (PK23-PK24, 2 items), Process (PK25-PK26, 2 items), and Physical Evidence (PK27-PK30, 4 items). A four-point Likert scale was used (1 = Strongly Disagree to 4 = Strongly Agree), chosen deliberately without a neutral midpoint to reduce central-tendency bias in respondents' answers.

Prior to the main analysis, the 30-item instrument was tested for validity using Pearson product-moment correlation, correlating each item's score against the total score; an item was considered valid if $r\text{-count} > r\text{-table}$ at $\alpha = 0.05$ for $n = 31$. Internal-consistency reliability was assessed using Cronbach's Alpha (Cronbach, 1951), with a coefficient ≥ 0.60 considered acceptable for an exploratory research instrument of this kind.

Table 1. *Validity and Reliability per item Results*

<i>Items Code</i>	<i>r count</i>	<i>Sig.</i>	<i>Cronbach's Alpha</i>
PK1	0.591	0.03	.930
PK2	0.535	0.002	.925
PK3	0.569	0.001	.925
PK4	0.771	0	.922
PK5	0.456	0.01	.926
PK6	0.382	0.034	.927
PK7	0.356	0.03	.928
PK8	0.535	0.002	.925
PK9	0.530	0.03	.931
PK10	0.393	0.09	.928
PK11	0.586	0.001	.924
PK12	0.689	0	.923
PK13	0.643	0	.924
PK14	0.791	0	.921
PK15	0.677	0	.923
PK16	0.57	0.001	.925
PK17	0.664	0	.923
PK18	0.63	0	.924
PK19	0.711	0	.922
PK20	0.648	0	.924
PK21	0.73	0	.922
PK22	0.414	0.021	.927
PK23	0.686	0	.923
PK24	0.81	0	.921
PK25	0.657	0	.923
PK26	0.627	0	.924
PK27	0.53	0.002	.925
PK28	0.521	0.003	.925
PK29	0.564	0.001	.925
PK30	0.527	0.002	.925

Table 2. *Reliability for All Items Results*

<i>Cronbach's Alpha</i>	<i>N of Items</i>
.927	30

Data were analyzed using descriptive statistics to calculate the mean value of each item

and the mean value per dimension. Mean values were interpreted using the following intervals: 1.00-1.75 = Very Poor; 1.76-2.50 = Poor; 2.51-3.25 = Fairly Good; 3.26-4.00 = Good. Dimensions with a mean above the overall average were categorized as strengths, while those below the average were categorized as areas requiring improvement. Based on this score pattern, three priority strategic pillars were formulated, derived directly from the questionnaire findings

Results and Discussion

1. Respondent Profile

This study involved 31 respondents, all of whom met the purposive sampling criteria and were prospective umrah pilgrims matching PT. X's target market profile. The questionnaire was distributed directly, achieving a 100% response rate. The majority of respondents belonged to the productive age segment with upper-middle financial capacity, which represents PT. X's primary market segment for umrah products, particularly the corporate and family segments.

2. Measurement Results per Marketing Mix 7P Dimension

Table 3 presents the mean values of all 30 statement items along with the mean value per dimension, based on responses from 31 respondents.

Table 3. Mean Scores of the 7P Marketing Mix Questionnaire Items and Dimensions

<i>Dimension</i>	<i>Key Indicator</i>	<i>Code</i>	<i>Item Mean</i>	<i>Dimension Mean</i>
Product	Alignment of the package with pilgrims' expectations	PK1	3.516	3.425
	Alignment of the package with pilgrims' expectations	PK2	3.452	
	Quality of facilities included in the travel package	PK3	3.484	
	Quality of facilities included in the travel package	PK4	3.387	
	Alignment of the itinerary with pilgrims' needs	PK5	3.355	
Price	Alignment of the itinerary with pilgrims' needs	PK6	3.355	3.290
	Alignment of price with the facilities received	PK7	3.258	
	Affordability of the umrah package price	PK8	3.355	
	Affordability of the umrah package price	PK9	3.065	
	Affordability of the umrah package price	PK10	3.387	
Place	Transparency of costs within the umrah package	PK11	3.355	3.306
	Transparency of costs within the umrah package	PK12	3.323	
	Ease of access to services and office location	PK13	3.516	
	Ease of access to services and office location	PK14	3.161	
	Ease of obtaining product information	PK15	3.226	
Promotion	Ease of obtaining product information	PK16	3.323	3.231
	Clarity of information in promotional activities	PK17	3.355	
	Clarity of information in promotional activities	PK18	3.290	
	Attractiveness of promotional materials and media	PK19	3.258	
	Attractiveness of promotional materials and media	PK20	3.129	
People	Trust in the information promoted	PK21	3.129	3.323
	Trust in the information promoted	PK22	3.226	
	Staff professionalism in service	PK23	3.290	
	Staff professionalism in service	PK24	3.355	

<i>Dimension</i>	<i>Key Indicator</i>	<i>Code</i>	<i>Item Mean</i>	<i>Dimension Mean</i>
Physical Evidence	Clarity of service flow and standards	PK25	3.290	3.339
	Clarity of service flow and standards	PK26	3.387	
	Physical appearance and comfort of the office	PK27	3.516	
	Physical appearance and comfort of the office	PK28	3.419	3.468
	Physical appearance and comfort of the office	PK29	3.548	
	Physical appearance and comfort of the office	PK30	3.387	

The overall mean of the 30 questionnaire items is 3.340, which falls within the "Good" category (3.26–4.00). This indicates that, overall, respondents consider PT. X's umrah products to be adequate. However, there is meaningful variation across dimensions, which forms the basis for determining strategic priorities.

Physical Evidence obtained the highest score (3.468). The appearance of the office (PK29: 3.548 and PK27: 3.516) were the highest-scoring items across the entire questionnaire, indicating that PT. X's physical facilities create a very positive impression on consumers – an asset that should continue to be maintained. Product ranked second (3.425). Item PK1 (alignment of the package with pilgrims' expectations: 3.516) reflects that consumers consider the products already relevant, though there is room to increase variety through stronger differentiation.

Process (3.339) and People (3.323) are above the overall mean but are closely positioned to one another. The strong Process score indicates that service procedures are perceived as well-structured, while the slightly lower People score suggests a need to improve staff competence, particularly in umrah-specific matters. Place (3.306) and Price (3.290) fall below the overall mean. The score for PK9 (price affordability: 3.065) is the lowest across the entire questionnaire – the only item approaching the boundary of the "Fairly Good" category – indicating that pricing is a critical point that must be strategically addressed. Promotion received the lowest score (3.231) and is the only dimension in the "Fairly Good" category. PK20 and PK21 (attractiveness of promotional materials and trust in promotional information, both 3.129) are the second- and third-lowest items across the entire questionnaire, reinforcing the urgency of improvement in this dimension.

Table 4. Ranking of 7P Marketing Mix Dimensions by Mean Score

<i>Rank</i>	<i>Dimension</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Category</i>	<i>Strategic Implication</i>
1	Physical Evidence	3.468	Good	Maintain the consumer-trust asset
2	Product	3.425	Good	Increase product differentiation variety
3	Process	3.339	Good	Improve umrah-specific SOPs
4	People	3.323	Good	Improve umrah-specific competence
5	Place	3.306	Good	Expand reach into the non-corporate segment
6	Price	3.290	Good	Optimize perceived price-benefit value
7	Promotion	3.231	Fairly Good	MAIN PRIORITY: intensive digital promotion

3. Competitor Benchmarking: Digital Promotion and Human Resource Capacity

To contextualize the Promotion and People findings above, secondary data on competitors' digital marketing activity and human resource capacity were collected through non-participant observation of each travel agency's public Instagram account and publicly available company information.

Table 4. Comparative Digital Promotion and Human Resource Capacity: PT. X vs. Benchmark Travel Agencies

<i>Indicator</i>	<i>PT. X</i>	<i>Travel A</i>	<i>Travel B</i>	<i>Travel C</i>
Instagram followers	12,700	1,600	25,900	32,400

Average posts / week	1-2	3-4	3-4	4-5
Permanent / certified religious guides	1	Numbers of professional & experienced	18 (Lc. degree)	4 (nationally certified)

Source: researcher observation in June 2025

Table 4 shows a clear digital and human-resource capacity gap between PT. X and its more digitally mature competitors. Travel C's Instagram following (32,400) is more than double PT. X's (12,700), and its posting cadence (4-5 times per week) is two-to-three times more frequent than PT. X's (1-2 times per week) -- a pattern consistent with the questionnaire finding that Promotion is PT. X's weakest dimension (3.231) and the only one not yet reaching the "Good" category. Likewise, PT. X's single permanent religious guide compares unfavorably with Travel B's 18 Lc.-qualified preachers and Travel C's four nationally certified guides, corroborating the questionnaire-based finding that People (3.323) sits below the overall mean and requires targeted improvement. Read together, the primary questionnaire data (consumer perception) and this secondary benchmarking data (market comparison) converge on the same two priority areas -- Promotion and People -- strengthening the empirical basis for Pillars 1 and 3 of the strategy proposed in the following section.

These findings both confirm and refine the pattern reported in prior 7P studies in the umrah and broader tourism sector. Consistent with Muchtar et al. (2024), who found Place, Promotion, People, Process, and Physical Evidence to be significant predictors of visitor loyalty at Tapandullu Beach, Physical Evidence again emerges here as the strongest dimension, echoing their observation that tangible facility quality is a particularly potent driver of consumer perception. However, whereas Sulistio et al. (2024) and Rachmi et al. (2025) both frame price and service quality as the most influential Umrah-specific satisfaction determinants, the present descriptive score pattern shows Price sitting close to, rather than far below, the overall mean (3.290 vs. 3.340), suggesting that for PT. X's consumers price is a secondary rather than a primary source of dissatisfaction -- a divergence that may reflect the difference between inferentially-modeled satisfaction determinants and directly-observed perception scores. Promotion's position as the weakest dimension is, by contrast, strongly corroborated by the wider literature: Nasution et al. (2026) similarly found that digital promotion lagged behind an otherwise adequately implemented 7P mix at another Indonesian umrah operator, and UI Husna et al.'s (2025) systematic review of 118 studies concludes that digital marketing became the primary competitive battleground for Hajj and Umrah agencies from 2023 onward -- a shift PT. X's own posting cadence and follower count (Table 4) show it has only partially made. Three factors specific to PT. X plausibly explain why Promotion, rather than another dimension, scored lowest. First, PT. X's promotional cadence (1-2 posts/week) and reach (12,700 followers) lag substantially behind the more digitally mature competitors benchmarked in Table 4, indicating an under-resourced digital promotion function rather than a fundamentally flawed product or service. Second, PK21 (trust in promotional information: 3.129) -- one of the two lowest-scoring items in the entire questionnaire -- points to a credibility gap: consumers are not simply seeing too little promotional content, but do not yet find the content they do see convincing, which the largely claims-based promotional material currently in use, rather than pilgrim testimonials or other verifiable evidence, plausibly explains. Third, because Physical Evidence -- PT. X's strongest asset -- is not yet being systematically converted into promotional content, the company's most persuasive

competitive advantage remains under-leveraged in its promotional communication, compounding the Promotion score's weakness.

4. Three Strategic Development Pillars

Based on the questionnaire score pattern shown in Table 2, three strategic pillars were formulated that directly respond to the empirical findings from 31 respondents. The order of the pillars was determined based on urgency and the largest gap between actual conditions and optimal potential.

The first pillar -- strengthening digital promotion and marketing -- is designed to increase sales volume and brand awareness. This pillar responds directly to the lowest Promotion score (3.231) among all 7P dimensions, the only one that has not yet reached the "Good" category. The two lowest-scoring items in the entire questionnaire fall within this dimension: PK20 (attractiveness of promotional materials: 3.129) and PK21 (trust in promotional information: 3.129). These figures indicate that promotion is not only insufficient in volume, but that existing content is not yet convincing enough for consumers.

Three concrete strategies emerge from these findings. First, optimization of paid digital platforms. PT. X needs to integrate TikTok Ads, Instagram Ads, and an Umrah Landing Page as an interconnected digital ecosystem. The recommended content format is short 15–30 second videos showing the atmosphere of worship at Masjid al-Haram, hotel facilities, and authentic pilgrim testimonials. Instagram Ads can be utilized through Carousel Ads to visually compare package advantages. A dedicated mobile-first landing page should include transparent pricing details, a travel gallery, and a registration form linked to the sales team. Second, the development of a structured pilgrim testimonial system. The finding for PK21 (trust in promotional information: 3.129) shows that consumers need tangible evidence, not merely claims. The mechanism: immediately after pilgrims return, the sales team contacts them via WhatsApp to request a short 30–60 second testimonial video or voice note. This content is then edited and consistently uploaded as Instagram Reels, Stories, or graphic quotes. PT. X already has a post-trip satisfaction questionnaire in place, but its results have not yet been processed into public testimonial content. Third, increasing the frequency and consistency of social media content. PT. X currently posts content 1–2 times per week with approximately 12,700 Instagram followers, whereas Travel C posts 4–5 times per week with approximately 32,400 followers. A realistic target is to increase posting frequency to at least 3–4 times per week with varied content: umrah rituals education, behind-the-scenes departure preparation, facility highlights, and product promotion. The website, which is currently not up to date, also needs prompt updating, given that all benchmark travel agencies already have more informative websites.

The second pillar, Diversification and Differentiation of Umrah Products, is derived from two interrelated questionnaire findings: Product ranks second (3.425), indicating an already-solid product foundation, while Price ranks sixth (3.290), with PK9 as the lowest item (price affordability: 3.065), indicating the need for more diverse price variants. The highest Physical Evidence score (3.468) adds further capital, showing that PT. X's physical facilities are already convincing -- a foundation that can be leveraged to create more diverse products.

Three recommended differentiation strategies. First, the development of an Umrah Plus Al-Ula Package as a premium 12–14 day product combining umrah worship with a visit to the Al-Ula world cultural heritage site. This package targets repeat pilgrims who have previously performed umrah and desire a different experience. This differentiation is not offered by any of the benchmark travel agencies and represents a distinguishing feature

that would be difficult to replicate in the short term. Second, the development of an Umrah Community Study-Group Package. PT. X has a strong corporate network advantage that has not yet been leveraged for the Islamic community segment. This package is designed specifically for religious study groups (majelis taklim), Islamic organizations, or study-group communities with a minimum of 20 participants, complete with joint ritual guidance sessions, exclusive religious talks (tausiyah), and more competitive group pricing. This strategy simultaneously addresses the Place weakness (3.306), which indicates that penetration into the non-corporate segment remains limited. Third, the development of a Budget-Based Umrah Package. The PK9 score (price affordability: 3.065) is the strongest signal that consumers feel constrained by limited price options. This package allows prospective pilgrims to assemble their own travel components – choosing airlines, hotel categories, and itineraries – according to their individual financial capacity. PT. X already has exclusive partnerships with Bank Mega and Allo Bank that provide special discount programs, an advantage not held by any of the competitors analyzed, which can be maximized through this package.

The third pillar, Improving Human Resource Competence and Umrah-Specific Service Standards, is derived from the People dimension (3.323) falling below the overall mean (3.340), and the Process dimension (3.339), which, although above average, still shows a meaningful gap relative to Physical Evidence (3.468). These two dimensions are interrelated: existing service procedures (Process) need to be supported by more competent human resources in umrah-specific matters (People) so that service quality can improve comprehensively.

Three human resource and service standard development strategies. First, an Umrah Tour Leader certification program and Fiqh of Worship training. PT. X currently has only one permanent religious guide, whereas Travel B has 18 preachers holding a Lc. degree, and Travel C has four nationally certified guides. A certification program in collaboration with institutions recognized by the Ministry of Religious Affairs, complemented by Umrah Fiqh of Worship training covering the procedures for tawaf, sa'i, and etiquette in the Holy Land, will improve human resource competence while also increasing pilgrim trust. Second, the development of a comprehensive Umrah-Specific SOP. The current SOP still uses general tourism service standards, whereas umrah has a spiritual dimension that requires different handling. The umrah-specific SOP should cover: daily worship guidance while in the Holy Land, protocols for handling pilgrim complaints that take physical and emotional conditions into account, emergency response procedures related to visa regulations or schedule changes, and communication standards with pilgrims before, during, and after the trip. Third, the development of a technology-based service quality management system. The Process dimension score (3.339) indicates that operational standards are already considered good but can be further improved through process digitalization. A simple CRM system that records pilgrims' travel history, preferences, and feedback can help the sales team provide more personalized service. This system can also be used for structured post-departure follow-up that generates pilgrim testimonials as material for digital promotion – linking Pillar 3 with Pillar 1.

Table 5. Cross-Mapping of the Three Strategic Pillars against the 7P Marketing Mix Dimensions

<i>7P Dimension</i>	<i>Pillar 1: Digital Promotion</i>	<i>Pillar 2: Product Diversification</i>	<i>Pillar 3: HR & Umrah SOP</i>	<i>Score</i>
Physical Evidence	Use physical facilities as visual promotional content	Facilities become an advantage in premium packages	Facility maintenance standards included in SOP	3.425
Product	Promote the uniqueness of each package specifically	FOCUS: Diversification into three new package types	Competent guides improve product quality	3.339
Process	Digitalize processes through WhatsApp Business & CRM	New SOPs for each developed package type	FOCUS: Comprehensive umrah-specific SOP	3.323
People	Skilled staff assist in producing testimonial content	Certified Tour Leaders support premium packages	FOCUS: Certification & fiqh of worship training	3.306
Place	Expand reach via social media & roadshows	Community packages reach the non-corporate segment	Sufficient HR supports regional expansion	3.290
Price	Communicate value through transparent pricing content	FOCUS: Budget-Based Package & bank partnerships	HR expertise justifies premium pricing	3.231
Promotion	FOCUS: Digital platforms, content, testimonials	Each new package requires a dedicated promotion strategy	Competent staff = more authentic promotional content	3.425

Table 5 shows that the three strategic pillars do not stand alone but rather reinforce one another. Improving HR competence (Pillar 3) directly supports product quality (Pillar 2) while also generating more authentic promotional content (Pillar 1). Product diversification (Pillar 2) requires stronger promotion to become known in the market (Pillar 1) and competent HR for proper execution (Pillar 3). This is what makes it necessary to implement all three pillars simultaneously rather than sequentially.

Conclusion

This study set out to measure PT. X's competitiveness across the 7P Marketing Mix from the consumer's perspective and to translate the resulting score pattern directly into implementable strategy; both aims are addressed directly by the findings.

Consumer perceptions across the seven dimensions produced an overall mean of 3.340 ("Good"), with Physical Evidence the strongest dimension (3.468) and Promotion the weakest (3.231) – the only dimension not yet reaching "Good." The complete ranking (Physical Evidence → Product → Process → People → Place → Price → Promotion) splits into three above-average strengths (Physical Evidence, Product, Process) and four below-average priorities (People, Place, Price, Promotion), with Promotion and Price of particular concern given how close several of their items sit to the lower category boundary (notably PK9, PK20, and PK21).

This score pattern maps directly onto the three strategic pillars proposed. Promotion's weakness drives Pillar 1 (digital-platform optimization, a pilgrim testimonial system, and higher posting consistency); the combination of a strong Product base with a pressured Price dimension drives Pillar 2 (the Al-Ula Plus, Community Study-Group, and Budget-Based packages); and the below-average People score, paired with a Process dimension still short of Physical Evidence, drives Pillar 3 (Tour Leader certification, fiqh of worship training, and an umrah-specific SOP). The three pillars are mutually reinforcing rather than hierarchical and are intended for simultaneous, not sequential, implementation.

Beyond its managerial contribution, the study offers a modest theoretical contribution: it shows that the 7P Marketing Mix can serve not only as a predictive framework tested through inferential modeling (Elgarhy & Mohamed, 2023), but also as a direct diagnostic and strategy-formulation tool at the level of a single service firm — a role that carries added weight in the religious/halal tourism context, where trust and spiritual credibility (Battour & Ismail, 2016) add a layer of complexity absent from conventional tourism services.

Limitation and Future Research

This study has several limitations that should be considered when interpreting its findings. First, the sample size ($n = 31$) was small and drawn through purposive (non-probability) sampling from a single travel agency, which limits statistical generalizability to the broader population of Indonesian umrah consumers or to other travel agencies. Second, the analysis is purely descriptive; no inferential statistical tests were used to establish whether differences between dimension means are statistically significant, so comparative claims in this study should be read as descriptive patterns rather than statistically confirmed differences. Third, competitor-related information (e.g., social media follower counts, number of certified guides) was gathered through non-systematic secondary observation rather than a standardized competitive-intelligence protocol, and may become outdated quickly.

Future research could extend this study by employing probability sampling across multiple travel agencies to improve generalizability; applying inferential techniques such as regression or structural equation modeling to test the influence of 7P dimensions on outcomes such as satisfaction, trust, or purchase intention (cf. Elgarhy & Mohamed, 2023); and incorporating an Importance-Performance Analysis (IPA) design -- collecting both importance and performance ratings for each item -- to more rigorously prioritize strategic interventions than a performance-only descriptive design allows.

References

- Alwinie, A. A., Nurhayati, P., & Sartono, B. (2024). The role of 7P marketing mix toward consumer satisfaction and loyalty of XYZ beauty clinic. *Journal of Consumer Sciences*, 9(1), 40-62.
- AMPHURI. (2025). Menguak kinerja penyelenggara haji dan umrah sebelum UU Nomor 14 Tahun 2025. <https://amphuri.org/menguak-kinerja-penyelenggara-haji-dan-umrah-sebelum-uu-nomor-14-tahun-2025>
- Barney, J. B. (1991). Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99-120.
- Battour, M., & Ismail, M. N. (2016). Halal tourism: Concepts, practises, challenges and future. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 19, 150-154.
- Black, R., & Ham, S. (2005). Improving the quality of tour guiding: Towards a model for tour guide certification. *Journal of Ecotourism*, 4(3), 178-195.
- Cronbach, L. J. (1951). Coefficient alpha and the internal structure of tests. *Psychometrika*, 16(3), 297-334.
- Elgarhy, S. D., & Mohamed, L. M. (2023). The influences of services marketing mix (7Ps) on loyalty, intentions, and profitability in the Egyptian travel agencies: The mediating

- role of customer satisfaction. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism*, 24(6), 782-805. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1528008X.2022.2080148>
- Fadilah, A. F., & Solahudin, D. (2025). The impact of service quality and trust on Umrah pilgrim satisfaction at PT. Adhiya Tour & Travel Bandung in 2024. *Mabrur: Academic Journal of Hajj & Umrah*, 4(1), 15-27.
- GoodStats. (2025). Jumlah jemaah umrah Indonesia tembus 648 ribu pada 2025. <https://goodstats.id/article/jumlah-jemaah-umrah-indonesia-tembus-648-ribu-per-april-2025-terus-meningkat-sejak-2022-myGHb>
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, Direktorat Jenderal Penyelenggaraan Haji dan Umrah. (2024). Data Penyelenggara Perjalanan Ibadah Umrah (PPIU) tahun 2024.
- Koh, K. L., & Ahad, N. A. (2020). Determination of sample size in using central limit theorem for Weibull distribution. *Journal of Science and Mathematics Letters*.
- Kotler, P., & Keller, K. L. (2016). *Marketing Management* (15th ed.). Pearson Education.
- Kotler, P., Bowen, J. T., Makens, J. C., & Baloglu, S. (2017). *Marketing for Hospitality and Tourism* (7th ed.). Pearson.
- Memon, M. A., Thurasamy, R., Ting, H., & Cheah, J.-H. (2025). Purposive sampling: A review and guidelines for quantitative research. *Journal of Applied Structural Equation Modeling*, 9(1), 1-23. [https://doi.org/10.47263/jasem.9\(1\)01](https://doi.org/10.47263/jasem.9(1)01)
- Muchtar, Aqsa, M., & Sudirman, H. A. (2024). Pengaruh bauran pemasaran 7P terhadap loyalitas pelanggan yang dimoderasi kepuasan pelanggan pada pengunjung wisata Pantai Tapandullu Kabupaten Mamuju. *Jurnal Aplikasi Bisnis dan Manajemen*, 10(1), 263. <https://doi.org/10.17358/jabm.10.1.263>
- Nasution, M. Y. M., Indra, A. P., & Anggraini, T. (2026). Analysis of marketing strategies for Umrah products at PT. Grand Syahira Haramain. *Al-Urban: Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah dan Filantropi Islam*, 10(1), 1-19.
- Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1988). SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*, 64(1), 12-40.
- Qurani, H. R., & Mulyono, N. B. (2025). Improving customer satisfaction in service quality evaluation using the CARTER framework: A case study of SS Umrah and Travel in Indonesia. *Journal of Multidisciplinary Academic Business Studies*, 2(4), 257-268. <https://doi.org/10.35912/jomabs.v2i4.3526>
- Rachmi, N., Istiatin, I., & Sudarwati, S. (2025). Umrah pilgrimage satisfaction reviewed from service, facilities, price perception, and trust. *Fokus Ekonomi: Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi*, 20(1), 65-78.
- Rindu, R., Hafizurrachman, M., Haryanto, A. N., & Zakaria, W. N. A. (2025). The 7Ps marketing mix in hospital services: A systematic mapping of applications through a scoping review. *Jurnal Pendidikan Keperawatan Indonesia*, 11(1), 91-102.
- Sugiyono. (2022). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D* (Cetakan ke-4). Alfabeta.
- Sulistio, B., Fauziah, N., & Anggraini, D. (2024). The influence of service quality, prices, and promotions on the satisfaction of pilgrims on Hajj and Umrah destinations at the Hajj and Umrah Travel Agency PT. Pandi Kencana Murni. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Humanities Research and Review*, 3(1), 45-58.

- Ul Husna, A., Ilyas, M. A., Nurfadilah, S. R., Rizky, B., & Agustiawan, O. (2025). Digital marketing transformation in Hajj and Umrah agencies: A systematic literature review. *Indonesian Journal of Da'wah Management Scholars*, 1(2), 82-87. <https://doi.org/10.64991/indo-jdms.v1i02.29>
- Viona, Mahadewi, N. P. E., & Sagita, P. A. W. (2023). Pengaruh bauran pemasaran terhadap keputusan pembelian produk wisata di Bilibli Travel pada masa pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal IPTA*, 11(1), 143-150. <https://doi.org/10.24843/IPTA.2023.v11.i01.p19>
- Yi, C. L. (2017). How tour guides' professional competencies influence on service quality of tour guiding and tourist satisfaction: An exploratory research. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 7(1), 1-19.
- Zeithaml, V. A. (1988). Consumer perceptions of price, quality, and value: A means-end model and synthesis of evidence. *Journal of Marketing*, 52(3), 2-22.