

## Internalization Of Tolerance Values In The Al-Kafirun Surat Verse 6 And The Al-Baqarah Surat Verse 256 In Forming Moderate Attitudes Of Students At Muhammadiyah Vocational School Berau

Weny Alpina<sup>a,1</sup>, Khamam Khosiin<sup>b</sup>, Benny Prasetya<sup>c</sup>

<sup>a,c</sup> Institut Ahmad Dahlan Probolinggo , Indonesia

<sup>b</sup> STIT Muhammadiyah Tanjung Redeb, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup>[wenyalpina79@gmail.com](mailto:wenyalpina79@gmail.com) , <sup>2</sup>[khamamkhosiin95@gmail.com](mailto:khamamkhosiin95@gmail.com) , <sup>3</sup>[prasetyabenny@gmail.com](mailto:prasetyabenny@gmail.com)

\*Correspondent Author; <sup>\*</sup>[khamamkhosiin95@gmail.com](mailto:khamamkhosiin95@gmail.com)

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article history

Received:

28-03-2026

Revised:

17-04-2026

Accepted:

07-05-2026

#### Keywords

Qur'anic tolerance,  
religious moderation,  
Islamic Religious Education,  
QS. Al-Kafirun,  
QS. Al-Baqarah,  
moderate attitude,  
vocational school.

### ABSTRACT

This study aims to analyze the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values in shaping students' moderate attitudes at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau. The study focuses on the values contained in QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 as theological foundations for religious tolerance, respect for difference, and rejection of coercion in matters of faith. This research used a qualitative case study approach. Data were collected through in depth interviews, classroom observation, and document analysis involving Islamic Religious Education teachers, school leaders, students, and parents. The findings show that the internalization process occurs through Islamic Religious Education learning, teacher role modeling, dialogic discussion, school culture, student activities, and daily habituation. PAI teachers play a central role as interpreters of Qur'anic values, facilitators of dialogue, and moral examples for students. Supporting factors include the school's vision, Muhammadiyah religious culture, teacher commitment, anti-bullying policy, student activities, peer interaction, and family support. However, several obstacles remain, such as students' uneven understanding of tolerance, social media influence, rigid family backgrounds, limited learning time, and the persistence of jokes that may demean religious identity. The study concludes that Qur'anic tolerance values contribute to students' moderate attitudes, especially in respecting differences, rejecting coercion, communicating ethically, cooperating with peers, and solving conflicts peacefully.



### Introduction

Indonesia's plural society requires education that does not only transfer religious knowledge but also shapes students' ability to live respectfully with people from different religious, social, and cultural backgrounds. In this context, religious moderation has become an important educational framework because it promotes balance, tolerance, non-violence, national commitment, and respect for local culture as moral foundations for social harmony (Nasir & Rijal, 2021). Islamic Religious Education has a strategic role in strengthening these values because it provides theological, moral, and pedagogical foundations for students' character formation (Nurhayati & Rosadi, 2022). Mulyana found

that Islamic Religious Education textbooks in Indonesia contain moderation values such as tolerance, fairness, egalitarianism, and non-violence, and their implementation can support a safe and respectful school environment for Muslim and non-Muslim students (Mulyana, 2023).

Tolerance in Islamic education should not be reduced to passive acceptance of difference. It must be developed into an active moral attitude that enables students to respect others, avoid coercion, reject discrimination, and communicate ethically in diverse social settings. Suparjo, Hanif, Dimas, Suwito, and Efendi showed that inclusive religious education can encourage religious tolerance among adolescents and help students from different faiths interact harmoniously and work together (Suparjo, Hanif, Dimas, Suwito, & Efendi, 2022). The Qur'an provides a strong normative basis for this educational mission. QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6, "For you is your religion, and for me is my religion," affirms the principle of respecting religious boundaries without hostility. QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256, "There is no compulsion in religion," affirms freedom of belief and rejects religious coercion. These two verses offer a theological foundation for teaching students that firmness in faith must be accompanied by respect for the dignity and freedom of others. Research on Qur'anic religious pluralism shows that learning models based on Qur'anic values can prevent religious prejudice and increase substantive religious moderation among Muslim students (Ma'arif, Rahmat, Yahya, & Syafei, 2024).

The importance of Qur'anic tolerance education becomes more urgent when religious identity enters students' daily communication, including classroom interaction, peer humor, and social media activity. Rahmat and Yahya reported that inclusive Islamic Religious Education teaching materials were more effective in increasing religious tolerance and reducing radicalism than conventional materials in a quasi-experimental study involving Indonesian students (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022). The context of SMK Muhammadiyah Berau shows that tolerance education needs a more systematic and contextual model. The thesis document reports several initial problems, including varied student understanding of tolerance, jokes or comments that demean religious identity, and limited curricular or extracurricular activities that focus on interreligious dialogue and tolerance formation.

These problems show that tolerance cannot be taught only as a concept. It must be internalized through learning, school culture, teacher example, student habituation, and reflective dialogue. Religious moderation education will be stronger when students experience tolerance as part of daily school life, not only as material in Islamic Religious Education classes. Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo found that religious moderation education becomes more effective when it is developed through structured curriculum, learning activities, and institutional evaluation (Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, & Sutoyo, 2024). Previous studies have discussed religious moderation in higher education, Islamic boarding schools, public schools, and Islamic Religious Education textbooks. Nasir and Rijal focused on the mainstreaming of moderation in Islamic higher education institutions (Nasir & Rijal, 2021). Mulyana examined religious moderation values in junior high school Islamic Religious Education textbooks and their implementation in schools (Mulyana, 2023). Rahmat and Yahya tested inclusive Islamic Religious Education materials to increase tolerance and reduce radicalism among students (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022). Suparjo et al. explored inclusive religious education for developing tolerance among teenagers in Yogyakarta (Suparjo et al., 2022).

However, these studies have not sufficiently examined how specific Qur'anic verses, especially QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256, are understood, taught, and internalized in a vocational Islamic school with Muhammadiyah characteristics. This gap is important because vocational schools have a distinctive

educational orientation. They prepare students not only for academic success but also for social interaction in workplaces and wider society. Therefore, tolerance and moderation are essential competencies for vocational students who will engage with diverse communities after graduation.

The novelty of this study lies in three main aspects. First, it integrates textual Qur'anic values with empirical educational practice by focusing on QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 as the main sources of tolerance education. Second, it examines the process of value internalization in a vocational Muhammadiyah school, a context that has received limited attention in previous studies. Third, it analyzes not only the meaning of tolerance but also the pedagogical process, supporting and inhibiting factors, and implications for students' moderate attitudes in school life.

This study is important because intolerance, religious prejudice, and exclusive attitudes can weaken students' social maturity and school harmony. Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah argued that religious moderation is needed to develop open religious understanding, dialogue, and cooperation across generations in Indonesia (Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, & Sa'diyah, 2022). Mutawali also emphasized that Islamic moderation can become a paradigm for reducing the penetration of radical ideology when Islamic texts are understood through a balanced and purposeful framework (Mutawali, 2023).

Based on this background, this study aims to analyze the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values in shaping students' moderate attitudes at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau. The study focuses on how tolerance values in QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 are interpreted in Islamic Religious Education, how teachers and the school environment support the internalization process, what factors facilitate or hinder the process, and how these values appear in students' moderate behavior in daily school life.

## Methods

This study employed a qualitative descriptive case study design to examine how Qur'anic tolerance values are understood, taught, practiced, and internalized in the real school context of SMK Muhammadiyah Berau (Mtisi, 2022). Qualitative research was selected because the study focuses on meaning, experience, interaction, and context rather than numerical measurement or statistical comparison (Lim, 2025). The case study approach was appropriate because the research investigated one bounded educational setting, namely SMK Muhammadiyah Berau, where the internalization of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 was examined through learning practices, school culture, teacher roles, and student behavior (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2020).

The focus of this study followed three main research questions: the process of internalizing Qur'anic tolerance values, the supporting and inhibiting factors, and the implications of these values for students' moderate attitudes in school life. This focus required an interpretive method because the researcher needed to understand how teachers and students gave meaning to tolerance, how the values were transformed in Islamic Religious Education, and how students practiced moderation in daily interaction (Bingham, 2023). The research was conducted at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau because the school represents an Islamic vocational education context that integrates Qur'anic values into character formation. The site was also relevant because preliminary findings showed that tolerance education had been implemented but still required deeper investigation into its internalization mechanism, pedagogical strategy, habituation process, and practical challenges.

The participants were selected through purposive sampling because the study needed informants who had direct knowledge, experience, and involvement in tolerance education at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau (Ahmad & Wilkins, 2024). The main informants

consisted of Islamic Religious Education teachers, the principal or vice principal, students, and parents because these groups represent the instructional, institutional, experiential, and family dimensions of value internalization. Snowball sampling was also used when additional informants were needed, such as homeroom teachers or extracurricular mentors who had relevant information about students' religious moderation and social interaction. The final number of participants was determined by data adequacy and saturation, meaning that data collection continued until new interviews and observations no longer produced substantially new themes (Bouncken, Czakon, & Schmitt, 2026).

Data were collected through three techniques: in depth interviews, direct observation, and document analysis. The use of several techniques helped the researcher obtain a complete picture of how Qur'anic tolerance values were introduced, discussed, modeled, habituated, and reflected in student behavior. Semi-structured interviews were used to explore the perspectives of teachers, school leaders, students, and parents regarding tolerance, religious moderation, classroom learning, school culture, and factors that supported or hindered value internalization (Jordan, Clarke, & Coates, 2021).

Observation was conducted in classrooms and school activities to identify how tolerance values appeared in teacher student interaction, peer communication, learning methods, religious activities, and conflict resolution practices. Observation was important because qualitative research requires attention to social behavior and real interaction, not only verbal statements from participants (Creswell & Poth, 2021). Document analysis was used to examine lesson plans, teaching materials, school programs, religious activity records, student guidance documents, and other institutional documents related to character education and religious moderation. Document analysis supported the interview and observation data by showing how tolerance values were formally planned, written, and institutionalized in school programs.

The main instrument in this study was the researcher. The researcher designed the interview guide, observation guide, and document review sheet to keep the data collection process aligned with the research questions. The interview guide covered students' understanding of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256, teachers' strategies in teaching tolerance, school efforts to strengthen moderation, and visible changes in students' social behavior. The observation guide focused on classroom dialogue, teacher modeling, student responses, peer respect, language use, cooperation, and avoidance of discriminatory behavior. The document review sheet focused on curriculum documents, religious activity programs, disciplinary guidelines, and school character building policies.

Data were analyzed through thematic qualitative analysis. The analysis began with data familiarization by reading interview transcripts, observation notes, and documents repeatedly. The researcher then coded meaningful statements related to Qur'anic tolerance values, teacher strategies, school culture, supporting factors, inhibiting factors, and students' moderate attitudes. Coding helped the researcher organize raw qualitative data into meaningful analytical units (Coates, Jordan, & Clarke, 2021).

After coding, the researcher grouped similar codes into broader themes. The themes included the transformation of Qur'anic values through Islamic Religious Education, dialogical learning, teacher role modeling, habituation of respectful behavior, school policy support, family support, social media influence, peer communication, and the manifestation of moderate attitudes. The findings were then presented in narrative form and supported by selected interview excerpts, observation descriptions, and document evidence. The final stage involved drawing conclusions by comparing patterns across informants and data sources. This process followed the logic of systematic qualitative analysis, which requires careful interpretation, transparency, and evidence-based theme development (Pérez-Guerrero & Alonso-Moraga, 2024).

The trustworthiness of the data was ensured through source triangulation, technique triangulation, member checking, and researcher reflexivity. Source triangulation was conducted by comparing information from teachers, students, school leaders, and parents. Technique triangulation was conducted by comparing interview data with observation and document data. The use of interviews, observations, and documents strengthened the validity of findings because each technique complemented the others in explaining the internalization of tolerance values.

Member checking was used by asking selected informants to confirm whether the researcher's interpretation was accurate and consistent with their intended meaning. This step was applied carefully because recent methodological debates show that member checking can improve rigor when it is used reflectively and not merely as a formal checklist (Lloyd, Hyett, & Kenny, 2024). Researcher reflexivity was also maintained by recording field notes, analytical memos, and possible researcher assumptions during data collection and analysis. Reflexivity was important because qualitative research requires the researcher to remain aware of subjectivity, power relations, and interpretation risks (Hall & Liebenberg, 2024).

Ethical considerations were applied throughout the study. Before data collection, participants received information about the study's purpose, procedures, voluntary participation, and their right to withdraw. The researcher protected participant confidentiality by using initials or pseudonyms in transcripts and reports. Data were stored securely and used only for academic purposes. These procedures were important because qualitative studies involving interviews and personal experience must protect informed consent, privacy, confidentiality, and participant dignity (Newman, Guta, & Black, 2021).

Through this method, the study was expected to produce an empirical and contextual understanding of how QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 were internalized in Islamic Religious Education and school culture. The method also allowed the researcher to explain how Qur'anic tolerance values shaped students' moderate attitudes through learning, habituation, teacher example, school policy, and social interaction.

## Results and Discussion

### 1. Islamic Spiritual Counseling as an Emotional Safe Space

The findings of the study show that Islamic spiritual counseling functions as an emotional safe space for broken-home students at SMP Muhammadiyah Tanjung Redeb. The Process of Internalizing Qur'anic Tolerance Values. The findings show that the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau does not occur through classroom instruction alone. It develops through three connected layers: institutional policy, Islamic Religious Education learning, and students' daily social experience. These three layers create a school ecosystem that allows the values of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 to move from textual knowledge into social attitudes and moderate behavior. The thesis data show that the school internalizes tolerance through institutional policy, PAI learning, and students' direct experience in everyday interaction.

The first process is institutional internalization. The school places moderation, noble character, and inclusive social contribution as part of its educational orientation. The principal explained that the school vision and mission emphasize students who are morally strong, socially harmonious, and religiously moderate. This means that tolerance is not treated as an additional theme, but as part of the school's formal identity. Such a finding is in line with Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo, who found that religious moderation

becomes stronger when it is embedded in curriculum design, institutional programs, and systematic evaluation rather than delivered as occasional moral advice (Mukhibat et al., 2024).

The institutional process also appears in concrete school rules and routines. The school applies anti bullying policies, the 5S culture, character coaching, mediation, counseling, and teacher coordination to build respectful interaction. These programs function as cultural instruments that guide students to avoid discrimination, solve conflict peacefully, and respect personal differences. The principal also stated that teachers must include moral and tolerance values in lesson plans, especially in PAI and Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah learning. This finding supports Mulyana's study, which showed that the implementation of moderation values in Islamic Religious Education can create a safe and respectful school environment for Muslim and non Muslim students when teachers apply tolerance, fairness, and non-violence in school practice (Mulyana, 2023).

The second process is pedagogical internalization through Islamic Religious Education. The teacher does not only explain the meaning of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 at the textual level. The teacher connects the verses with real cases, student interaction, social diversity, and ethical communication. The school data show that PAI teachers use conceptual explanation, thematic discussion, contextual interpretation, and dialogical learning to introduce the meaning of "lakum dinukum waliya din" and "la ikraha fid-din" in students' daily life. This finding is consistent with Rahmat and Yahya, who found that inclusive PAI teaching materials were more effective in increasing religious tolerance and reducing radicalism than conventional teaching materials (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022).

This pedagogical process shows that Qur'anic tolerance values are internalized through meaning-making. Students are not asked only to memorize the verses. They are guided to understand that QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 teaches respect for religious boundaries, while QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 teaches that faith cannot grow through coercion. This makes Qur'anic learning more ethical, reflective, and social. Ma'arif, Rahmat, Yahya, and Syafei found that an educational communication model based on Qur'anic religious pluralism could prevent religious prejudice and increase substantive religious moderation among Muslim students (Ma'arif et al., 2024).

The third process is internalization through teacher modeling. The findings show that the PAI teacher becomes a living example of tolerance. The teacher explains religious values through calm communication, inclusive language, and open dialogue. Students reported that the teacher explained tolerance with real examples and did not teach in a judgmental way. This made them feel comfortable discussing sensitive issues about religion and difference. This supports Suparjo, Hanif, Dimas, and Efendi's finding that inclusive religious education can encourage religious tolerance and help students from different religious backgrounds interact harmoniously and work together (Suparjo et al., 2022).

The teacher's role also changes the classroom climate. The classroom becomes a safe space for asking questions, discussing differences, and learning how to disagree respectfully. This is important because tolerance cannot grow in a classroom that uses fear, pressure, or one-way instruction. The finding strengthens Saada's argument that Islamic religious education should include moral reasoning, reflective thinking, and tolerance so that students can develop responsible citizenship in diverse societies (Saada, 2023).

The fourth process is habituation through school culture. The Qur'anic values are not limited to classroom learning. They appear in morning coaching, AIK activities, student organization, character slogans, peer interaction, and conflict mediation. These repeated practices help students experience tolerance as a normal part of school life. The thesis data show that school culture presents the values of "lakum dinukum waliya din" and "la ikraha

fid-din" through academic and cultural approaches, including morning guidance, AIK activities, and social interaction that respects belief and personal choice.

This habituation process makes internalization gradual. Students first receive knowledge. Then they discuss it. After that, they practice it in social interaction. Over time, tolerance becomes part of their character. This pattern supports Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah's finding that religious moderation is influenced by intellectual, ideological, practical, and experiential dimensions of religiosity. Their study shows that religious understanding and religious practice can support moderate attitudes when they are connected with tolerance, national commitment, and cultural accommodation (Subchi et al., 2022).

The fifth process is student reception and personal meaning. Students showed that they understood tolerance as respect for different beliefs, freedom of thought, and the ability to avoid imposing personal views. Some students explained that moderate attitude means being balanced, willing to discuss calmly, and able to maintain good relationships despite different beliefs. A non Muslim student said that the verses made them feel respected because Islam recognizes diversity. Another student said that the two verses teach respect for religious freedom and reject coercion. This finding is important because it shows that internalization reaches the affective level. Students do not only know the Qur'anic message. They feel its social meaning. Non-Muslim and non-religious students reported that the learning process gave them a sense of safety and recognition. This shows that Qur'anic tolerance education can create an inclusive school climate when teachers present Islamic texts in a humanistic and dialogical way. Mulyana also found that tolerance values in Islamic Religious Education emphasize religious freedom and national commitment without placing one group as socially superior to others (Mulyana, 2023).

The sixth process is transformation into moderate behavior. The findings show that students' moderate attitudes appear in their willingness to respect difference, avoid coercion, discuss calmly, cooperate across backgrounds, and maintain friendship despite different views. This means that the internalization process has passed the cognitive level and moved toward social practice. Mutawali argues that Islamic moderation can reduce radical ideology when Islamic texts are understood through balanced purposes and ethical reasoning rather than rigid and exclusive interpretation (Mutawali, 2023).

Based on these findings, the internalization process can be interpreted through three stages. The first stage is value transformation, where the school and PAI teacher introduce the Qur'anic meaning of tolerance through lesson plans, classroom explanation, and institutional programs. The second stage is value transaction, where students engage in dialogue, discussion, case analysis, and social reflection. The third stage is transinternalization, where the values become visible in students' daily behavior, such as respectful language, non discriminatory interaction, peaceful conflict resolution, and openness toward difference. This staged process explains why Qur'anic tolerance education needs policy support, teacher modeling, dialogical pedagogy, and habituated school culture.

The discussion shows that the strongest point of SMK Muhammadiyah Berau lies in the integration between text, pedagogy, and school culture. QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 gives students the ethical basis for respecting difference without weakening their own faith. QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 gives students the moral basis for rejecting coercion and protecting personal belief. When these two verses are taught through dialogue, example, and daily practice, they become a strong foundation for moderate character formation. This finding strengthens Ma'arif et al.'s conclusion that Qur'anic religious pluralism can become an effective educational communication model for increasing students' substantive moderation (Ma'arif et al., 2024).

Thus, the process of internalizing Qur'anic tolerance values at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau can be understood as a holistic educational process. It combines institutional commitment, PAI learning, teacher example, habituation, student experience, and reflective meaning making. The process proves that tolerance in Islamic education should not stop as doctrine. It must become a lived school culture that shapes students into moderate, respectful, and socially responsible individuals.

## 2. Islamic Religious Education Teacher Strategies in Instilling Tolerance

The findings show that Islamic Religious Education teachers at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau use several connected strategies to instill tolerance. These strategies include Qur'anic contextualization, dialogic learning, teacher modeling, habituation, case-based discussion, student collaboration, and integration of tolerance values into school culture. The thesis data show that PAI teachers do not only explain tolerance conceptually in class, but also internalize it through daily school practices, student activities, and Qur'anic value-based learning.

The first strategy is contextualizing QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 in classroom learning. The teacher explains that QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 teaches respect for religious boundaries, while QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 teaches that faith cannot grow through coercion. This strategy helps students understand that Islamic tolerance does not mean weakening faith, but respecting the dignity and freedom of others. This finding supports Ma'arif, Rahmat, Yahya, and Syafei, who found that Qur'anic religious pluralism can reduce religious prejudice and increase substantive moderation among Muslim students when Qur'anic texts are taught through reflective and dialogic communication (Ma'arif et al., 2024).

The second strategy is using dialogic learning. The teacher gives students space to ask, respond, and discuss sensitive issues related to difference, belief, and social interaction. This method changes the classroom from a one-way religious instruction space into a reflective space where students can learn how to express opinions politely and listen to others. Rahmat and Yahya found that inclusive PAI teaching materials were more effective in increasing religious tolerance and reducing radicalism than conventional materials because students were invited to engage with religious diversity in a structured way (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022).

The third strategy is case-based learning. The teacher links Qur'anic tolerance values with concrete problems that students may face, such as mocking religious identity, rejecting different opinions, misusing social media, or forcing others to accept one view. This strategy helps students connect religious texts with real moral choices. Nurbayani and Amiruddin stated that PAI teachers can implement religious moderation values through discussion, case studies, problem-based learning, role-playing, and project-based learning (Nurbayani & Amiruddin, 2024).

The fourth strategy is teacher modeling. The PAI teacher becomes a direct example of tolerance through calm speech, fair treatment, open communication, and respect for students' different backgrounds. In this study, the teacher's behavior has a strong educative role because students observe how religious values are practiced, not only how they are explained. Jannah found that Islamic Religious Education teachers play a crucial role as models and facilitators in instilling tolerance through dialogic learning, interfaith activities, and curriculum integration (Jannah, 2025).

The fifth strategy is habituation through daily school culture. Teachers strengthen tolerance by guiding students to greet each other respectfully, avoid insulting language, work together in groups, and solve disagreements without hostility. This strategy matters because tolerance becomes stronger when students repeat good behavior in real situations.

Mulyana found that religious moderation values such as tolerance, fairness, equality, and non-violence become effective when teachers and students apply them collaboratively in school life (Mulyana, 2023).

The sixth strategy is integrating tolerance into student activities. At SMK Muhammadiyah Berau, religious moderation is strengthened through student coaching, leadership training, organizational activities, Islamic character programs, and school interaction. These activities train students to respect difference, discuss problems wisely, and make decisions without discrimination. The thesis data show that school programs, religious activities, and student development activities support the growth of mutual respect and cooperation among students.

The seventh strategy is collaboration between PAI teachers, school leaders, and other teachers. Tolerance education becomes stronger when the PAI teacher does not work alone. The principal, student affairs staff, homeroom teachers, and other subject teachers support the same values through school rules and daily supervision. Nurfahmi, Ajahari, and Surawan found that religious moderation is more effective when religious education teachers collaborate with other teachers and receive support from principals and school regulations (Nurfahmi, Ajahari, & Surawan, 2025).

The eighth strategy is building a safe and inclusive classroom climate. The teacher encourages students to speak without fear, disagree without hostility, and ask questions without being judged. This strategy helps students see tolerance as a practical skill in communication. Saada argued that Islamic religious education needs moral reasoning, reflective thinking, and tolerance to prepare students for responsible citizenship in diverse societies (Saada, 2023). The ninth strategy is strengthening anti-violence and non-coercive religious understanding. The teacher explains that Islam rejects coercion in matters of faith and encourages peace in social relations. This strategy directly supports the meaning of QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256. Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah found that religious moderation in Indonesian Muslims includes tolerant religious understanding, rejection of violence, and respect for diversity (Subchi et al., 2022). The tenth strategy is developing students as active agents of tolerance. Students are not treated only as recipients of religious knowledge. They are encouraged to become actors who promote respect, cooperation, and peaceful interaction among peers. Mustakim, Ali, and Kamal found that students can become agents of religious moderation when teachers design learning materials and activities that empower them to prevent radicalism and violent extremism (Mustakim, Ali, & Kamal, 2021).

The discussion shows that the teacher's strategy works through three pedagogical stages. The first stage is value introduction, where the teacher explains the meaning of Qur'anic tolerance through QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256. The second stage is value interaction, where students discuss, question, compare, and reflect on tolerance in real-life cases. The third stage is value practice, where students apply tolerance through communication, cooperation, and respectful behavior in school life. This staged process is consistent with Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo, who found that religious moderation education becomes stronger when it moves through curriculum planning, implementation, and evaluation (Mukhibat et al., 2024).

These findings also show that the PAI teacher's strategy has a distinctive Qur'anic character. The teacher does not teach tolerance as a secular social concept only. The teacher grounds tolerance in Islamic texts, especially the principles of religious freedom, respect for difference, and rejection of coercion. This approach helps students understand that moderate attitudes are part of Islamic moral teaching. Mappiasse and Hayadin found that students' tolerance is shaped by school type, religious education, and the broader social policy context in which students learn religion (Mappiasse & Hayadin, 2022).

Overall, the most effective strategy is not a single teaching method. It is the combination of Qur'anic explanation, dialogic learning, teacher example, daily habituation, student activities, and institutional support. This integrated strategy allows tolerance to move from knowledge into attitude and from attitude into behavior. Shalahuddin, Arromy, Mahmud, and Erihadiana also found that religious moderation can be implemented through intracurricular, extracurricular, co-curricular, and school culture programs when leadership and teachers share a strong commitment (Shalahuddin, Arromy, Mahmud, & Erihadiana, 2024). Thus, the role of the PAI teacher at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau is central. The teacher acts as interpreter of Qur'anic values, facilitator of dialogue, moral model, classroom manager, and cultural agent. Through these roles, tolerance becomes more than a lesson topic. It becomes a lived educational practice that shapes students into moderate, respectful, and socially responsible individuals.

### 3. Supporting Factors in the Internalization of Qur'anic Tolerance Values

The findings show that the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau is supported by several interconnected factors, namely institutional policy, the role of Islamic Religious Education teachers, Qur'anic-based learning, school culture, student activities, peer interaction, and family support. These factors work together to transform the values of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 from religious knowledge into students' moderate attitudes and daily social behavior. The thesis data show that school policy, PAI learning, student activities, and social interaction function as major supporting factors in building students who are academically competent, vocationally skilled, and moderately religious.

The first supporting factor is the school's institutional vision. SMK Muhammadiyah Berau places moderation, noble character, inclusiveness, and social harmony as part of its educational orientation. The principal explained that the school vision and mission emphasize students who have good character, achievement, and the ability to contribute harmoniously in social life. This institutional direction makes tolerance part of the school's identity, not only a topic in Islamic Religious Education. Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo found that religious moderation education becomes stronger when it is integrated into curriculum design, institutional policy, and educational evaluation. (Mukhibat et al., 2024).

The second supporting factor is the school's structured policy. The school implements anti-bullying rules, the culture of greeting and 5S, character coaching, and value-based learning planning. These policies help students avoid discrimination, respect differences, and solve problems through dialogue. The thesis data show that the principal requires teachers to include moral and tolerance values in lesson plans, especially in PAI and Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah subjects. This finding supports Mulyana's study, which shows that religious moderation values in Islamic Religious Education become effective when teachers and students apply tolerance, fairness, equality, and non-violence in the school environment. (Mulyana, 2023).

The third supporting factor is the central role of PAI teachers. PAI teachers act as interpreters of Qur'anic values, classroom facilitators, moral models, and guides for student behavior. They explain that QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 teaches respect for religious boundaries, while QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 teaches that faith cannot be forced. This helps students understand that tolerance is rooted in Islamic teaching. Alabdulhadi and Alkandari found that Islamic education teachers play a key role in promoting wasatiyyah values by shaping students' personalities away from extremism (Alabdulhadi & Alkandari, 2024).

The fourth supporting factor is contextual and dialogic learning. The PAI teacher does not only explain Qur'anic verses in textual form. The teacher connects the verses with

real student experiences, such as friendship, classroom discussion, joking, social media use, and respect for different beliefs. This method makes students see tolerance as practical moral behavior. Rahmat and Yahya found that inclusive Islamic Religious Education teaching materials were more effective in increasing religious tolerance and reducing radicalism than conventional materials (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022).

The fifth supporting factor is the Muhammadiyah school culture. The Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah framework supports Islamic character formation that is open, progressive, and socially responsible. In the thesis data, the school's religious orientation is described as friendly, inclusive, and non-extreme. This supports the internalization process because students receive the same moral message from classroom learning, religious activities, and school culture. Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah found that religious moderation is related to tolerant religious understanding, rejection of violence, national commitment, and respect for diversity (Subchi et al., 2022).

The sixth supporting factor is student activities. The school strengthens tolerance through leadership training, student organizations, religious activities, and Islamic character programs. These activities train students to cooperate, respect different opinions, and make decisions wisely. Student activities also provide real spaces where tolerance can be practiced beyond classroom theory. Suparjo, Hanif, Dimas, and Efendi found that inclusive religious education encourages religious tolerance and helps students from different faiths interact harmoniously and work together (Suparjo et al., 2022).

The seventh supporting factor is the presence of a respectful peer environment. Students learn tolerance not only from teachers, but also from daily interaction with classmates. When students work in groups, discuss learning tasks, join organizations, and solve small conflicts, they practice the values of respect and self-control. This peer experience supports the transition from cognitive understanding to social habit. Mappiasse and Hayadin found that students' religious tolerance is shaped by school type, social environment, and the broader educational context in which students learn religion (Mappiasse & Hayadin, 2022).

The eighth supporting factor is collaboration among school actors. The internalization of tolerance does not depend only on PAI teachers. It also involves the principal, vice principal for student affairs, homeroom teachers, subject teachers, and student supervisors. The thesis data show that the headmaster and student affairs division support programs that create a safe, religious, and diversity-friendly school atmosphere. Nurfahmi, Ajahari, and Surawan found that religious moderation can be instilled successfully when religious education teachers collaborate with other teachers and receive support from principals and school regulations (Nurfahmi et al., 2025).

The ninth supporting factor is family support. Parents help continue the values taught at school by strengthening respectful behavior at home. This factor matters because students need consistency between school values and family values. The thesis identifies parents as important informants because they support the continuity of tolerance values outside school. Religious tolerance grows more effectively when students receive similar messages from teachers, school leaders, peers, and families (Mappiasse & Hayadin, 2022).

The tenth supporting factor is the use of Qur'anic values as a theological foundation. QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 gives students a basis for respecting religious difference without weakening their own faith. QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 gives students a basis for rejecting coercion in religious matters. These verses make tolerance more acceptable to students because it is presented as part of Islamic morality. Ma'arif, Rahmat, Yahya, and Syafei found that Qur'anic religious pluralism can support educational communication that increases Muslim students' religious moderation (Ma'arif et al., 2024).

The discussion shows that these supporting factors form an integrated system. School policy provides formal direction. PAI teachers translate Qur'anic values into learning. School culture habituates respectful behavior. Student activities provide practice. Peer interaction builds social experience. Family support strengthens continuity. This system allows tolerance to become a lived value rather than a memorized concept. Saada argued that Islamic religious education should strengthen moral reasoning, reflective thinking, and responsible citizenship in diverse societies (Saada, 2023). The most important finding is that internalization works when the school combines theological clarity with humanistic practice. Students need to understand the Qur'anic basis of tolerance, but they also need a safe school climate where tolerance is practiced every day. This explains why the supporting factors at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau are not isolated. They create a shared educational ecology that helps students develop moderate attitudes, respectful communication, and peaceful interaction.

#### **4. Inhibiting Factors in the Internalization of Qur'anic Tolerance Values**

The findings show that the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau faces several obstacles that come from students' social environment, digital exposure, family background, limited learning time, and uneven student readiness to engage with difference. The school has built a structured monitoring system through homeroom teachers, counselling teachers, PAI teachers, and daily character observation, but the internalization of tolerance still needs continuous guidance because students do not enter school with the same religious understanding, social experience, or digital literacy (Alpina, 2025).

The first inhibiting factor is the influence of the external environment, especially social media. The principal stated that social media often becomes a space for hate speech, religious provocation, and intolerant content, while the PAI teacher also explained that students are frequently exposed to provocative content that normalizes intolerance. (Alpina, 2025). This finding confirms that digital exposure can shape students' religious understanding, because internet and social media platforms influence how young people access, interpret, and discuss religious moderation (Yuliawati & Asri, 2024).

This obstacle is serious because students often receive religious messages outside school without strong critical filters. When students consume short, emotional, and provocative religious content, they may understand religion through conflict narratives rather than ethical and dialogical values. This condition can weaken the meaning of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256, because both verses require calm reasoning, respect for difference, and rejection of coercion. Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah argue that religious moderation requires open religious understanding, dialogue, and cross-generational collaboration (Subchi et al., 2022).

The second inhibiting factor is the diversity of family backgrounds. The principal explained that some students bring exclusive or rigid ways of thinking from home before entering school. (Alpina, 2025). This means that the school does not only teach tolerance from zero, but also corrects previous habits, inherited assumptions, and narrow interpretations that students may receive from their closest environment. This finding aligns with studies on religious education which show that students' tolerance is shaped by school context, family context, and the broader social environment where religious values are practiced. (Mappiasse & Hayadin, 2022).

The third inhibiting factor is students' limited experience in interacting with people from different backgrounds. One student stated that limited encounters with people from different backgrounds can make students' perspectives narrow and can turn small differences into misunderstanding if they receive no guidance. (Alpina, 2025). This finding

shows that tolerance cannot grow only through explanation. Students also need direct social experience, guided interaction, and reflective dialogue. Wahyono, Budiningsih, Suyantiningsih, and Rahmadonna found that the way teachers understand multicultural education affects religious tolerance practices in educational settings (Wahyono, Budiningsih, Suyantiningsih, & Rahmadonna, 2022).

The fourth inhibiting factor is the limited time allocated for PAI and Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah learning. The principal stated that the limited time for AIK and PAI learning makes it difficult to discuss all values deeply, and the PAI teacher also viewed limited instructional time as a repeated obstacle (Alpina, 2025). This obstacle matters because internalization requires more than one meeting or one explanation. Students need repeated exposure, discussion, practice, evaluation, and feedback. Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo show that religious moderation education becomes stronger when curriculum, implementation, and evaluation work together systematically (Mukhibat et al., 2024).

The fifth inhibiting factor is students' uneven understanding of tolerance. Some students understand tolerance as mutual respect, while others still confuse tolerance with accepting all views without boundaries or staying silent in the face of difference. This uneven understanding weakens the internalization process because students may know the verses but fail to apply them in concrete social situations. Chotimah, Qudsy, and Yusuf warn that religious moderation can become superficial when it remains at the cognitive level and does not transform character and practice. (Chotimah et al., 2025). (Tandfonline)

The sixth inhibiting factor is the lack of inclusive and contextual teaching materials. The study shows that the teacher uses real examples and case studies, but the limited time and the complexity of students' backgrounds require richer learning materials that connect Qur'anic values with current social issues. (Alpina, 2025). Rahmat and Yahya found that inclusive Islamic Religious Education teaching materials can increase students' religious tolerance and reduce radicalism more effectively than conventional materials (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022).

The seventh inhibiting factor is students' psychological and social barriers. Students mentioned fear of difference, ego in argument, lack of diversity education, and family influence as reasons why some students find it difficult to be tolerant. (Alpina, 2025). This means that intolerance does not always appear as open hostility. It can also appear as fear, defensive communication, rigid self-positioning, and unwillingness to listen. Saada argues that Islamic religious education needs moral reasoning and reflective thinking so students can become responsible members of plural societies. (Saada, 2023).

The eighth inhibiting factor is the challenge of maintaining teacher consistency and institutional collaboration. The school already involves homeroom teachers, counselling teachers, PAI teachers, and other educators in character monitoring, but this system requires continuous coordination so that tolerance values do not depend only on one teacher. (Alpina, 2025). Nurfahmi, Ajahari, and Surawan found that religious moderation coaching becomes more effective when teachers, principals, and school regulations work together through effective communication and a supportive school environment. (Nurfahmi et al., 2025).

The ninth inhibiting factor is the gap between school values and digital culture. The school teaches tolerance through PAI, AIK, school culture, and character programs, but students still meet opposing narratives in digital spaces after school hours. This creates a value competition between Qur'anic tolerance education and online intolerance. Alabdulhadi and Alkandari show that Islamic education teachers face challenges in promoting wasatiyyah values among high school students, although teachers remain central in guiding learners away from extremism (Alabdulhadi & Alkandari, 2024).

The tenth inhibiting factor is the risk of intolerance in student communication. The initial observation in the thesis found that some students still made jokes or comments that demeaned religious identity, and this indicates that tolerance values had not fully shaped students' language ethics. (Alpina, 2025). This condition shows that internalization must reach the level of speech, humor, peer interaction, and conflict resolution. Kustati, Indra, Efendi, Ritonga, Nelmawarni, Yulia, and Karni found that religious moderation and national insight relate to students' radical behavior, which means that moderation education in secondary schools must address real attitudes and behavior, not only conceptual understanding (Kustati et al., 2023).

Overall, the inhibiting factors show that the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values is not a linear process. The school can teach QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256, but students still negotiate these values with family influence, peer culture, digital content, limited learning time, and personal ego. Therefore, the internalization process needs stronger integration between classroom learning, digital literacy, family communication, student reflection, counselling, and school culture. The most important implication is that tolerance must move from text to habit, from lesson to behavior, and from formal teaching to a shared school ecology.

### **5. Implications for Students' Moderate Attitudes**

The internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values has direct implications for the formation of students' moderate attitudes at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau. The study focuses on how QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 shape students' behavior in school life, especially in relation to religious respect, non-coercion, social harmony, and ethical interaction. This focus is consistent with the thesis objective, which aims to analyze the implications of Qur'anic tolerance values for students' moderate behavior in the school environment.

The first implication appears in students' cognitive understanding of tolerance. Students begin to understand that tolerance in Islam does not mean weakening religious identity. It means respecting the faith and dignity of others while maintaining one's own belief. QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 gives students a theological basis for respecting religious boundaries, while QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 gives them a moral basis for rejecting coercion in matters of faith. This finding is in line with Subchi, Zulkifli, Latifa, and Sa'diyah, who explain that religious moderation requires tolerance without falling into religious liberalism or extremism (Subchi et al., 2022).

The second implication appears in students' ability to distinguish between firmness in faith and hostility toward difference. Through Qur'anic-based learning, students learn that a Muslim can be firm in belief without insulting, excluding, or forcing others. This is important because moderate religiosity requires balance between religious commitment and respect for human dignity. Saada argues that Islamic religious education should develop moral, reflective, and civic awareness so that students can live responsibly in plural societies (Saada, 2023).

The third implication appears in students' affective awareness. Students become more sensitive to the feelings and rights of others. They are encouraged to avoid jokes, comments, or attitudes that demean religious identity. This implication is important because the thesis identifies jokes and comments that demean religious identity as one of the early problems in the school context. Mulyana found that religious moderation values in Islamic Religious Education include tolerance, fairness, equality, and non-violence, and these values can support a respectful school environment when teachers and students apply them in daily interaction (Mulyana, 2023).

The fourth implication appears in students' communication ethics. Students who internalize Qur'anic tolerance values tend to be more careful in speaking, arguing, and responding to difference. They learn that disagreement does not justify verbal violence, humiliation, or social exclusion. Rahmat and Yahya found that inclusive Islamic Religious Education materials were more effective in increasing religious tolerance and reducing radicalism because students were trained to engage with religious difference through structured learning (Rahmat & Yahya, 2022).

The fifth implication appears in students' willingness to cooperate with peers from different social, cultural, and religious backgrounds. Moderate students do not only tolerate others passively. They also show active respect through teamwork, mutual help, and peaceful interaction. Mappiasse and Hayadin found that students' religious tolerance is shaped by school type, social environment, and educational context, which means that school climate plays an important role in shaping tolerant behavior (Mappiasse & Hayadin, 2022).

The sixth implication appears in students' rejection of coercive religious attitudes. QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 teaches that religious belief cannot be produced through pressure, intimidation, or compulsion. This value helps students develop a moderate view that respects personal choice and rejects forced religious expression. This implication supports the core meaning of religious moderation as a way of practicing religion that avoids violence, coercion, and excessive exclusivism (Subchi et al., 2022).

The seventh implication appears in students' conflict management. Students who understand Qur'anic tolerance values are better prepared to solve conflict through dialogue, advice, mediation, and self-control. This is relevant because the thesis positions school interaction, student dynamics, and the manifestation of moderate attitudes as central concerns of the research. Mukhibat, Effendi, Setyawan, and Sutoyo show that religious moderation education becomes stronger when curriculum, implementation, and evaluation are organized systematically in educational institutions (Mukhibat et al., 2024).

The eighth implication appears in students' social identity. Students begin to see themselves not only as learners of religion but also as actors who must maintain harmony in school life. They become more aware that Islamic values require them to protect peace, respect difference, and prevent harmful behavior. Mustakim, Ali, and Kamal found that students can become agents of religious moderation when educational institutions empower them through moderate Islamic values and preventive character education (Mustakim et al., 2021).

The ninth implication appears in the growth of inclusive religious attitudes. Students learn to understand difference as a social reality that must be managed with wisdom. This does not remove religious boundaries. It helps students place those boundaries in an ethical and peaceful framework. Alabdulhadi and Alkandari found that Islamic education teachers can promote wasatiyyah values by guiding learners away from extremism and by shaping balanced religious personalities (Alabdulhadi & Alkandari, 2024).

The tenth implication appears in the strengthening of school culture. When Qur'anic tolerance values are taught through PAI learning, school activities, teacher example, and daily interaction, moderate attitudes become part of the school's moral climate. This means that moderation is not only an individual attitude. It becomes a collective school practice. The thesis explains that this research seeks to show how religious values are operationalized in Islamic education to form students' moderate character.

The discussion shows that the internalization of QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 produces at least four dimensions of moderate attitude. The first dimension is theological balance, which means students maintain their faith while

respecting other beliefs. The second dimension is ethical communication, which means students avoid insulting language, coercion, and religiously offensive jokes. The third dimension is social cooperation, which means students work with others across differences. The fourth dimension is peaceful problem-solving, which means students address conflict through dialogue and self-control.

These implications also show that Qur'anic tolerance education has practical relevance for vocational students. Students at SMK need social maturity because they will enter workplaces and public spaces with diverse people. Qur'anic tolerance values prepare them to become graduates who are not only skilled, but also respectful, cooperative, and socially responsible. This finding supports Saada's view that Islamic religious education should prepare students for moral and civic participation in diverse societies (Saada, 2023).

Overall, the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values contributes to the formation of moderate students who respect difference, reject coercion, communicate ethically, avoid discrimination, cooperate with peers, and solve conflict peacefully. The main implication is that tolerance must not stop as textual knowledge. It must become a lived attitude that appears in classroom behavior, peer relations, school activities, and social responsibility.

## Conclusion

The findings show that the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values at SMK Muhammadiyah Berau plays an important role in shaping students' moderate attitudes. QS. Al-Kafirun verse 6 and QS. Al-Baqarah verse 256 provide a strong theological foundation for teaching respect, religious freedom, non-coercion, and peaceful coexistence. These values help students understand that being firm in faith does not mean rejecting or demeaning others.

The internalization process occurs through several stages. First, teachers introduce the meaning of Qur'anic tolerance in Islamic Religious Education learning. Second, students discuss and reflect on the values through dialogue, case studies, classroom interaction, and school activities. Third, the values begin to appear in students' daily behavior, such as respecting differences, avoiding offensive speech, cooperating with peers, and solving conflict peacefully.

PAI teachers have a central role in this process. They act as interpreters of Qur'anic values, facilitators of dialogue, role models, and moral guides. Their strategies include contextualizing Qur'anic verses, using dialogic learning, connecting lessons with real-life cases, modeling tolerant behavior, and strengthening school culture. These strategies make tolerance more practical and meaningful for students.

The study also found several supporting factors. These include the school's vision, Muhammadiyah religious culture, teacher commitment, anti-bullying policy, student activities, peer interaction, and family support. These factors create an educational environment that helps students practice tolerance consistently.

However, the internalization process still faces obstacles. These include students' uneven understanding of tolerance, social media influence, rigid family backgrounds, limited learning time, lack of direct interaction with diverse groups, and the persistence of jokes or comments that can demean religious identity. These obstacles show that tolerance education must be continuous, systematic, and supported by all school members.

Overall, the internalization of Qur'anic tolerance values contributes to the formation of students who are moderate, respectful, open to dialogue, non-discriminatory, and socially responsible. The study confirms that tolerance in Islamic education should not remain as theoretical knowledge. It must become a lived value in classroom learning, school culture, peer relations, and everyday student behavior.

## References

- Ahmad, M., & Wilkins, S. (2024). Purposive sampling in qualitative research: A framework for the entire journey. *Quality & Quantity*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-024-02022-5>
- Alabdulhadi, M. M. J., & Alkandari, K. M. (2024). Practices of Islamic education teachers in promoting moderation (wasatiyyah) values among high school students in Kuwait: challenges and obstacles. *Cogent Education*, 11(1), 2365577.
- Bingham, A. J. (2023). A Five-Phase Process of Qualitative Data Analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 22, 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069231183620>
- Bouncken, R. B., Czakon, W., & Schmitt, F. (2026). Purposeful sampling and saturation in qualitative research methodologies: Recommendations and review. *Review of Managerial Science*, 20, 579–615. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11846-025-00881-2>
- Coates, W. C., Jordan, J., & Clarke, S. O. (2021). A practical guide for conducting qualitative research in medical education: Part 2, Coding and thematic analysis. *AEM Education and Training*, 5(4), e10645. <https://doi.org/10.1002/aet2.10645>
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2021). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.
- Hall, S., & Liebenberg, L. (2024). Qualitative description as an introductory method to qualitative research for master's-level students and research trainees. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 23, 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069241242264>
- Jannah, M. (2025). The role of Islamic Religious Education teachers in instilling religious tolerance values in schools. *Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies*, 3(1), 12–16. <https://doi.org/10.58723/ijfis.v3i1.257>
- Jordan, J., Clarke, S. O., & Coates, W. C. (2021). A practical guide for conducting qualitative research in medical education: Part 1, How to interview. *AEM Education and Training*, 5(3), e10646. <https://doi.org/10.1002/aet2.10646>
- Kustati, M., Indra, R., Efendi, Ritonga, M., Nelmawarni, Yulia, & Karni, A. (2023). The effect of national insight and religious moderation on radical behavior of secondary school students. *Education Research International*, 2023. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/2919611>
- Lim, W. M. (2025). What is Qualitative Research? An Overview and Guidelines. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14413582241264619>
- Lloyd, N., Hyett, N., & Kenny, A. (2024). To member check or not to member check? An evaluation of member checking in an interpretive descriptive study. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 23, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069241301383>
- Ma'arif, B. S., Rahmat, M., Yahya, M. W. B. H. M., & Syafei, M. (2024). Educational communication based on Qur'anic religious pluralism in increasing religious moderation of Muslim students in Indonesia. *International Journal of Religion*, 5(8), 557–569. <https://doi.org/10.61707/8j1fed40>
- Mappiasse, S., & Hayadin, H. (2022). Students' religious tolerance: Comparing Muslim students at public schools and pesantren. *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 16(2), 326–351. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2022.16.2.326-351>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2020). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook*.
- Mtisi, S. (2022). The qualitative case study research strategy as applied on a rural enterprise development doctoral research project. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 21, 16094069221145848. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069221145849>

- Mukhibat, M., Effendi, M., Setyawan, W. H., & Sutoyo, M. (2024). Development and evaluation of religious moderation education curriculum at higher education in Indonesia. *Cogent Education*, 11(1), 2302308. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2024.2302308>
- Mulyana, R. (2023). Religious moderation in Islamic religious education textbook and implementation in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, 79(1), 8592. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8592>
- Mustakim, Z., Ali, F., & Kamal, R. (2021). Empowering students as agents of religious moderation in Islamic higher education institutions. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i1.12333>
- Mutawali, M. (2023). Maqāṣid al-sharī'a as the foundation of Islamic moderation: Theophilosophical insight against extreme religious ideology. *Ulumuna*, 27(1), 341–366. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v27i1.560>
- Nasir, M., & Rijal, M. K. (2021). Keeping the middle path: Mainstreaming religious moderation through Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 11(2), 213–241. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v11i2.213-241>
- Newman, P. A., Guta, A., & Black, T. (2021). Ethical considerations for qualitative research methods during the COVID-19 pandemic and other emergency situations: Navigating the virtual field. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069211047823>
- Nurbayani, N., & Amiruddin, A. (2024). Teacher strategies in implementing religious moderation values in Islamic educational institutions. *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education*, 8(2), 778–787. Retrieved from <https://alhayat.or.id/index.php/alhayat/article/view/670>
- Nurfahmi, I., Ajahari, A., & Surawan, S. (2025). Islamic education teachers' role in cultivating religious moderation among students. *Jurnal Indonesia Studi Moderasi Beragama*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.64420/jismb.v2i2.310>
- Nurhayati, N., & Rosadi, K. I. (2022). Determinasi Manajemen Pendidikan Islam: Sistem Pendidikan, Pengelolaan Pendidikan Dan Tenaga Pendidikan Islam. *International Edition*, 3(1), 451–464.
- Pérez-Guerrero, E. E., & Alonso-Moraga, Á. (2024). Methodological and Statistical Considerations for Cross-Sectional Studies. *Journal of Clinical Medicine*, 13(14), 4005. <https://doi.org/10.3390/jcm13144005>
- Rahmat, M., & Yahya, M. W. B. H. M. (2022). The Impact of Inclusive Islamic Education Teaching Materials Model on Religious Tolerance of Indonesian Students. *International Journal of Instruction*, 15(1), 347–364. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2022.15120a>
- Saada, N. (2023). Educating for global citizenship in religious education: Islamic perspective. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 103. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102894>
- Shalahuddin, M., Arromy, M. M., Mahmud, M., & Erihadiana, M. (2024). Strategy for implementing religious moderation in Islamic education management. *Journal Corner of Education, Linguistics, and Literature*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.54012/jcell.v4i1.311>
- Subchi, I., Zulkifli, Z., Latifa, R., & Sa'diyah, S. (2022). Religious moderation in Indonesian Muslims. *Religions*, 13(5), 451. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13050451>
- Suparjo, S., Hanif, M., Dimas, I. S., Suwito, S., & Efendi, A. (2022). Inclusive religious education to develop religious tolerance among teenagers. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 17(8), 2861–2876. <https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v17i8.7135>
- Wahyono, S. B., Budiningsih, A., Suyantiningsih, S., & Rahmadonna, S. (2022). Multicultural education and religious tolerance: Elementary school teachers'

- understanding of multicultural education in Yogyakarta. *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 60(2), 467–508. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2022.602.467-508>
- Yuliawati, E., & Asri, I. (2024). Religious moderation: An analysis of understanding, internet and social media exposure and social interaction systems. *Jurnal The Messenger*, 14(2), 158–179. <https://doi.org/10.26623/themessenger.v14i2.2812>